

INTERNET GOVERNANCE FORUM

Multistakeholder Advisory Group Meeting

Geneva, 10-11 February 2010

Summary Report

1. The Multistakeholder Advisory Group (MAG) met in Geneva on 10-11 February 2010. The discussion focused on the preparation of the Vilnius meeting.
2. "IGF 2010 – developing the future together" was proposed as the overall theme for the Vilnius meeting.
3. The MAG discussed on how to shape the key themes as the agenda for the Vilnius meeting, taking into account the online contributions and the discussions held during the open consultations held on 9 February 2010.
4. The agenda suggested by the MAG is as follows:
 - Managing critical Internet resources
 - Security, Openness and Privacy
 - Access and Diversity
 - Internet governance for development (IG4D)
 - Taking stock of Internet governance and the way forward
 - Emerging issues: cloud computing.
5. The MAG also discussed the sub-themes that fall under the main heading of each key theme. The following list is preliminary and purely indicative. With regard to several sub-themes there were different views as to under which key theme they belonged. It is understood that all of these issues may not fit into the main sessions, but they may make good workshops that can feed into the sessions. The preliminary list of sub-themes is not based on a consensus among MAG members, but it reflects the wide variety of opinions held within the group as well as many comments made by stakeholders during the consultation process.

Critical Internet Resources

- Status of IPv6 availability around the world; examples and case studies
- The internationalization of critical Internet resources management
- The importance of new TLDs and IDNs for development
- Enhanced cooperation
- Maintaining the open architecture of the Internet
- Maintaining Internet services in situations of disaster and crisis.

Security, Openness and Privacy

It is understood that privacy and security could not to be traded off against one another or seen as opposing priorities. Both were seen as equally important, but the need to recognize the interrelation between the three topics was also seen as important. One of the aims of the session is to explore and discuss transnational cooperation in general and cross border law enforcement in particular in relation to all sub-themes.

- *Security theme*
 - Mobile telephony and Internet security
 - Security/privacy in the Internet of things

- The cultural and technological perspectives of regulating malicious Internet content
- *Openness theme*
 - Freedom of expression
 - Maintaining the open architecture of the Internet
 - Open standards
 - Free and open source software
 - Open access to knowledge
- *Privacy theme*
 - Global privacy standards, technological capabilities, business practices and legal developments
 - Protecting privacy; law and institutions
 - The right to be forgotten.

Access and Diversity:

- Public funding for broadband
- Issues with Internet on mobile network
- Regulatory issues and frameworks that encourage investments in this area
- International and local connectivity costs
 - Understanding all the components affecting access
 - Anti-competitive behaviours
 - Public policy and regulatory frameworks impacting costs
 - Technology for improved interconnection at lower costs
 - Bidirectional flow of payments (e.g. payment for access to local content by international providers)
- Rural wireless networking and Internet culture
- Filtering and blocking access to content and services
- IXP as best practice
- Maintaining Internet services in situations of disaster and crisis
- Innovation
 - Sustainable open source standards
 - Copyright, digital environment and access to knowledge
 - Cross border enforcement of IP - trade embargos
- Robustness and resilience of the infrastructure once created
- Multilingualism of Internet
 - Regional aspects of IDN
 - Content.

Internet Governance for Development (IG4D)

The focus of the discussions under this heading should be the link between the different sub-themes listed below and Internet governance in its different aspects. All discussions should relate to governance issues and avoid discussions on ICT4D.

- The Internet governance dimensions which impact social and economic inclusion and sustainability
- Starting at development and MDG goals and working backwards towards Internet governance
- Development agenda for Internet governance
- Creating multilingual knowledge bases
- Online cultural exchange
- Governance issues of mobile Internet
- Relevance of globally applicable regulatory frameworks and principles insuring equality of access
- Innovation and knowledge economy.

Taking stock of Internet governance and the way forward

- Looking at where we were five years ago on the main themes and where we are now on those themes.
- How has Internet governance globally advanced over the five years of the IGF?
- Capacity building; where were we five years ago and where are we now?

Emerging issues

- Cloud Computing
 - Public policy and privacy issues in cloud computing.
 - What happens to both data entered by consumers in the cloud but also data transferred into the cloud by institutions and governments?
 - Access and development in cloud computing.

6. It was agreed to follow the basic format of past meetings. The objective of the programme is to maximize the opportunity for open and inclusive dialogue and the exchange of ideas; to try and create feedback loops between the different types of sessions; to create opportunities to share best practices and experiences; to listen, dialogue and learn as well as to identify key themes that would, in the future, benefit from the multistakeholder perspective of the IGF.

7. There was a general agreement for improvements as regards the linkages between workshops and main sessions.

8. There was agreement to repeat the 'setting the scene' session, giving participants background on Internet governance in general and the IGF in particular. The intent of the session is to improve participants' ability to engage in and benefit from the IGF meeting. It will explain the basic functioning of the IGF and the issues it has been dealing with to assist in creating a common background with regard to the depth and focus of the discussions and maximize participation. The session will also give an overview of the programme.

9. The 'setting the scene' session will again be followed by a session bringing in different regional and national perspectives, as they emerged from various regional meetings. Remote hubs will be given the opportunity to interact with the meeting. This will be a moderated session and rapporteurs will be asked not to read out a report, but to focus on key priorities as they emerged from the session and identify commonalities with other meetings as well as differences and to convey messages wherever applicable. Reports should be made available well in advance of the session and will be posted on the IGF Web site in the section devoted to Regional and National Initiatives. Organizers of regional and national IGF type meetings are invited to hold open forums which will allow them to give a full in-depth report of the meeting. In addition, an open forum where all regional meetings could exchange experiences was mentioned as a possibility.

10. The MAG saw the open dialogue format as the most suitable way to approach most main sessions at the Vilnius meeting, as it was conducive to fostering an informed exchange of views among a maximum number of participants. Last year's session on critical Internet resources was seen as a model in this regard. For the emerging issues session on cloud computing it was felt that a small introductory panel could be helpful to give the definitional setting for the session and answer questions as they arise.

11. The MAG saw a need for improvements as regards the linkages between workshops and main sessions. Based on the criteria agreed upon before – namely the submission of a workshop report from previous meeting - there seems to be a realistic expectations that workshops would not exceed the number of sixty. Potential workshop organizers are invited to submit proposals related to the various sub-themes listed above. The findings of selected workshops will be woven into the proceedings of the relevant main session. As was done in previous years in the session on critical Internet resources, the moderators will call on workshop organizers to relate the viewpoints expressed in the workshop. All workshops will be requested to provide background papers for their sessions. Workshop organizers will also be asked to make available a brief report with a few bullet points

shortly after the workshop.

12. The remaining workshops will be selected as in previous years, based on an open call for workshop proposals and allocated on the basis of available slots and on avoiding duplication.

13. Individuals who would like to be a resource person, either as part of a workshop or a main session, are invited to register with the IGF secretariat. Organizers of workshops and sessions who are looking for people to fill a niche or a slot within their workshop proposals may access that list maintained by the Secretariat to find speakers and contributors for their sessions.

14. A first version of a rolling document with the revised draft programme outline will be posted shortly.

15. The next meeting will be held in form of an open planning meeting on 10-11 May 2010 in Geneva. All interested stakeholders are invited to attend the meeting.

16. The MAG will meet separately on 12 May 2010 to discuss the modalities of its work and make proposals as regards its own future, should the IGF mandate be extended. The discussions will include future mechanisms for deciding on the MAG composition and remit as well as working methods.

17. An additional open planning meeting will be held on 28-29 June 2010 and an additional MAG meeting, if necessary, can be held on 30 June 2010.

18. The following deadlines were set for the next months:

30 March: Deadline for submitting meeting/activity reports for Dynamic Coalitions

15 April: First deadline for providing proposals for workshops/best practices forums etc.

30 April: Deadline for expressing interest for registering as a resource person

30 May: Deadline for completing programmes and providing speakers list.

19. Calendar of meetings:

10-11 May Planning meeting open to all interested stakeholders
12 May MAG meeting

28-29 June Planning meeting open to all interested stakeholders
[30 June MAG meeting, if necessary]

17. A list of participants is attached to this report.

MEETING 10-11 February 2010

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Name	Position
Chairman	
Mr. Desai, Nitin	Delhi/Mumbai - Special Adviser to the Secretary-General for Internet Governance
Members	
Ambassador Alcaine, Miguel A	Geneva - Deputy Permanent Representative, Mission of El Salvador to the United Nations Office at Geneva
Mr. Al Shatti, Qusai	Kuwait City - Deputy Chairman of Kuwait Information Technology Society
Ms. Arida, Christine	Cairo - Director of Telecom Planning and Services, National Telecom Regulatory Authority, Egypt
Mr. Bajwa, Fouad	Lahore – Social Entrepreneur
Ms. Betancourt, Valeria	Quito - Coordinator of the Communication and Information Policy Programme in Latin America, Association for Progressive Communications (APC)
Mr. Cancio Meliá, Jorge ¹	Madrid - Adviser-Deputy to the Director of Information Society Services, General Direction for the Development of the Information Society, Ministry of Industry, Tourism and Trade
Mr. Dardailler, Daniel	Nice - Associate Chair for Europe, World Wide Web Consortium (W3C)
Ms. Diop Diagne, Ndéye Maimouna	Dakar - Director of Information and Communication Technology (ICT), Ministry of Posts, Telecommunications and ICT, Senegal
Ms. Dryden, Heather	Ottawa - Senior Advisor, International Telecommunications Policy and Coordination, Telecommunications Policy Branch, Industry Canada
Mr. Echeberría, Raúl	Montevideo - Executive Director/CEO, Latin American and Caribbean Internet Addresses Registry (LACNIC)
Ms. Fall, Coura	Dakar - Coordinator of GOREeTIC
Mr. Filip, Ondřej	České Budějovice - Chief Executive Officer of CZ.NIC (Czech Republic)
Mr. Galvani, Alvaro ²	Brasilia - Head, Division of Information Society, Ministry of External Relations
Mr. Gatete, Jean Yves	Bujumbura – Secretary-General, Collectif National pour le Développement Humainitaire
Mr. Graham, Bill	Ottawa - Global Strategic Engagement, Internet Society (ISOC)
Ms. Handley, Cathy	Chantilly, VA - Director for Government Affairs/Public Policy, American Registry for Internet Numbers (ARIN)
Ms. Hassan, Ayesha	Paris - Senior Policy Manager, E-Business, IT, and Telecoms, Executive in charge of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) Policy, International Chamber of Commerce (ICC)
Mr. Hilali, Abdelaziz	Rabat - Professor, Institut Supérieur des Télécommunications de Rabat ; President, Internet Society Morocco

¹ Replacing Ms. Häll, Maria, representing the EU Presidency

² Replacing Mr. Hansen, José Vitor

Ms. Hofmann, Jeanette	London - Senior Researcher, London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE) / Social Science Research Center Berlin
Mr. Jamil, Zahid U.	Karachi - Senior Partner and Barrister-at-Law, Jamil and Jamil, Chairman Domain Name Dispute Resolution Centre
Mr. Katundu, Michael	Nairobi - Assistant Director, Information Technology Communications Commission, Kenya
Mr. Matulis, Aurimas	Vilnius - Director of the Information Society Development Committee, Lithuania
Mr. McCain, Cecil	Kingston - Director of Post and Telecommunications, Ministry of Mining and Telecommunications, Jamaica
Ms. Murrey-Bruce, Freda Ruth	Abuja - Senior Manager, Strategy & Monitoring, Nigerian Communications Commission
Mr. Papadatos, George	Geneva - Minister-Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Greece to the United Nations Office at Geneva
Ms. Pereda, Katitza Rodriguez	Washington, DC – Director of EPIC’s International Privacy Project and Coordinator of The Public Voice Coalition
Ms. Primo, Natasha	Johannesburg - Coordinator, Association for Progressive Communications (APC) National ICT policy Advocacy Initiative
Mr. Quaynor, Nii	Accra - Chairman and Chief Executive Officer, Network Computer Systems; President, Internet Society of Ghana
Mr. Riehl, Frédéric	Bienne - Deputy Director, Head of International Relations Service at the Federal Office of Communications, Switzerland
Ms. Selaimen, Graciela	Rio de Janeiro - Executive Coordinator, Núcleo de Pesquisas, Estudos e Formação (NUPEF)
Mr. Siganga, Waudu	Nairobi – Computer Society of Kenya, Chair
Mr. Solines Moreno, Juan Carlos	Quito - Solines & Asociados Abogados, Partner; Professor of Technology & Law and Telecommunications Law, San Francisco de Quito University (USFQ)
Ms. Swinehart, Theresa	Marina del Rey, CA - Vice President, Global and Strategic Partnerships, Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)
Mr. Tang, Zicai	Beijing - Deputy Director, Department of International Cooperation, Ministry of Industry and Information Technology, China
Ms. Taylor, Emily	Oxford - Nominet.UK, Director of Legal and Policy
Ms. Warren, Jennifer A.	Alexandria, VA - Vice President, Technology Policy & Regulation, Lockheed Martin Corporation
Members participating remotely	
Ms. Nimpuno, Nurani	Stockholm - Outreach & Communications, Netnod/Autonomica
Mr. Sha'ban, Charles	Amman - Executive Director, Regional Office, Abu-Ghazaleh Intellectual Property
Mr. Lau, Stephen K.M.	Hong Kong - Chairman, Electronic Data System (EDS)
Ms. Cavalli, Olga del Carmen	Buenos Aires - Adviser for Technology, Ministry of Foreign Affairs Argentina
Inter-Governmental Organizations and the European Commission	
Ms. Kim, Jeoung Hee	ITU
Ms. Assefa, Sorine	ITU
Mr. Hamdi, Mongi	UNCTAD
Mr. Wachholz, Cédric	UNESCO

Ms. Hu, Xianhong	UNESCO
Ms. Yamanaka, Mika	UNESCO
Ms. Thaçi, Elvana	Council of Europe
Ms. Markot, Elisabeth	European Commission
Mr. Spearing, Patrick	UN-DESA
Regional Coordinators	
Mr. Schneider, Thomas	WEOG (Switzerland)
Advisors to the Chair and Others	
Mr. Fältström, Patrik	Stockholm - Consulting Engineer, Cisco Systems; Member, Board of Internet Society; Member, Swedish Government IT Advisory Group
Mr. Glaser, Hartmut	São Paulo - CEO, CGI.Br
Mr. Kleinwächter, Wolfgang	Aarhus – Professor, International Communication Policy and Regulation, University of Aarhus
Mr. Kurbalija, Jovan	Geneva/La Valetta – Director, DiploFoundation
Mr. Mazzone, Giacomo	European Broadcasting Union
Ms. Pandey, Tulika	Government of India
Ms. El Saadany, Nermine	Government of Egypt
Mr. Singh, Parminder Jeet	Bangalore – Executive Director, IT for Change
Ms. Shaw, Heather	New York – Director, International Telecommunications and Information Policy, United States Council for International Business
Advisors to the Chair participating remotely	
Ms. Gad, Nashwa	Government of Egypt
IGF Secretariat	
Mr. Kummer, Markus	Executive Coordinator
Mr. Masango, Chengetai	Programme and Technology Manager
Ms. Doria, Avri	Consultant
Mr. Nkurunziza, Jean Paul	Fellow
Mr. Arata, Seiiti	Intern