

**Internet Governance Forum  
Meeting of the Multistakeholder Advisory Group (MAG)**

**Geneva, 22-23 May 2013**

**Summary Report**

1. The Multistakeholder Advisory Group (MAG) met in Geneva from 22-23 May 2013 at the European Broadcasting Union headquarters. To allow for more fruitful discussions the meeting immediately followed the open consultations that were held on 21 May at the same location. The two-day discussion aimed to produce, with the inputs and expertise of the IGF community, the preliminary format and program for the 8<sup>th</sup> IGF meeting in Bali, Indonesia, which is to take place on 22 – 25 October 2013. The open consultations held on 21 May directly fed into the proceedings of the two- day MAG meeting
2. The meeting was led by the Honorary Chairman, Mr. Ashwin Sasongko, Director General of ICT Application, Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (CIT), Indonesia. Mr. Markus Kummer moderated the meeting as the interim chair of the open consultations and MAG meetings. Ms. Elia Armstrong and Mr. Vyatcheslav Cherkasov represented the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA) and Mr. Chengetai Masango represented the IGF Secretariat.
3. The Indonesian delegation gave a brief overview of preparations for the upcoming meeting in Bali and assured participants that preparations were going very well
4. The meeting was open to observers who were also encouraged to participate in the meeting, and was made available in the form of live text streaming and via web-cast on the IGF website for online participation of MAG members who could not make it to Geneva and to other interested stakeholders. The importance of remote participation and e-participation for the annual meeting and all preparatory meetings throughout the year was re-emphasized.
5. The MAG spent some time discussing the relevance of the 2013 IGF meeting in light of recent conferences such as the World Conference on International Telecommunication (WCIT), held in Dubai in December 2012, and the World Telecommunications/ICT Policy Forum held in Geneva the week before. There was a general sense that this year’s IGF could help move forward the discussions held at these meetings.
6. The MAG revisited the discussions on the overall theme for the 8<sup>th</sup> IGF meeting as initially discussed at the first open consultation and MAG meetings in February. In light of the above discussions, a consensus evolved to propose “Building Bridges - Enhancing Multistakeholder Cooperation for Growth and Sustainable Development” as the overarching theme for the meeting.
7. There was general support to propose the following sub-themes for the meeting:

- Access and Diversity - Internet as an engine for growth and sustainable development
- Openness - Human rights, freedom of expression and free flow of information on the Internet
- Security - Legal and other Frameworks: Spam, Hacking and Cyber-crime
- Enhanced Cooperation
- Principles of Multi-Stakeholder Cooperation
- Internet Governance Principles

8. One MAG Member felt that it would be preferable to maintain the headings and formats as used in the previous annual IGF meetings, as they had served the IGF well and contributed to its success. After the meeting, he proposed in writing the following sub-themes as an alternative:

- (Access and Diversity) Internet as an engine for growth and sustainable development
- (Openness and Privacy) Human rights and the Internet
- Internet Governance Principles
- (Security) Legal and other Frameworks: Spam, Hacking and Cyber-crime
- (Management of Critical Internet Resources) Principles of Multi-Stakeholder Cooperation and Enhanced Cooperation

The above wording found the support of two MAG Members.

9. The general feeling was that the new proposed format would take the IGF one step further. While maintaining the traditional IGF thematic discussions, it would introduce new formats and would refocus the traditional issues, thus keeping the IGF responsive to evolving needs. It was also felt that evolution was necessary in response to many suggestions made after the Baku meeting and also in light of the CSTD Working Group on IGF improvements.

10. The overall theme and sub-themes will now be proposed to the United Nations for consideration and approval.

11. The MAG agreed that it would be important to find appropriate linkages between the workshops and main sessions. The concept of 'feeder' workshops was reviewed, and in programming the Bali meeting it was agreed that linkages could instead come in the form of follow-up roundtable discussions amongst participants and organizers of workshops with similar themes, which could then produce outputs or participate actively in the main sessions rather than just reporting back in silos. It was proposed that the sessions that would be prepared in this way should be called Focus Sessions.

12. There was some consensus amongst participants that the Bali meeting should strive to produce some more tangible outcomes, recommendations, or 'take-aways' for participants and those following remotely. This would be in line with a recommendation from the CSTD working group on improvements to the IGF. All events will be encouraged to structure their meetings in a way to achieve this goal.

13. In response to a question raised during the February meeting, it was clarified that

there was no flexibility to move away from the traditional three-hour blocks, as the schedule of the interpreters could not be changed within the given resource allocation. However, the MAG is free to work within these minimal restraints when programming the meeting. Thus, the main sessions could be split up to become two 90-minute blocks rather than a full 3 hours or even split into three 1-hour blocks. Workshops could also be shorter than 90 minutes previously allocated. Ultimately, the timing of each session should be dependent on the substance and objective of each individual meeting.

14. There was agreement that it would be important to integrate the various National and Regional IGF initiatives into the program of the Bali IGF. The views and themes emerging at these initiatives should be captured in a significant way at the global meetings. In order to achieve this aim, a meeting of all these initiatives would be held as a pre-event on the day preceding the IGF meeting (on "Day Zero"); the target being to enable solution finding on how to insert the regional IGF into the global IGF agenda. There was a consensus that the inputs from the regional and national IGFs sessions at IGF Bali would feed into the final stock taking session, on the last day of the event.

15. Similarly, a meeting grouping all workshops relating to capacity building will also be scheduled as a pre-event on Day Zero.

16. The three working groups established in Paris on Internet Governance Principles, Enhanced Cooperation/Multistakeholder Cooperation and on IGF improvements reported back to the meeting on the intersessional work undertaken so far. The latter two held breakout meetings and discussed on how best to link their work to the annual meeting.

17. As a novelty, an orientation session will be held on each day and, as an experiment, two stocktaking sessions will be integrated into the programme, one at the end of the second day and one at the beginning of the afternoon session on the last day. There was an agreement that any organization or also governments could apply for a space to hold an open forum, subject to approval by the MAG.

18. There was general support for a draft outline for the schedule of the meeting, attached at Annex to this report.

19. Below is a brief overview of the draft schedule:

(a) Prior to the first official day of the meeting, a series of pre-events will be held as per IGF tradition, including events on capacity building and on National and Regional IGF initiatives.

(b) On the morning of the first day it's proposed that a main session might be held on the topic of the role of Governments in multi-stakeholder cooperation. This session would build upon recent discussions from the World Telecommunications/ICT Policy Forum (WTPF) where the IGF was identified as one of the platforms to take the discussion further.

(c) The opening ceremony would take place in the afternoon of the first day. The second and third days would each have two three-hour blocks for main sessions, and these three-hour blocks will perhaps be split in half to allow more concise and focused

discussions on the various main themes. These sessions – named focus sessions - will seek to be more output oriented and will integrate the various tracks of workshops in a constructive manner. The focus sessions will be preceded by a Round Table grouping all the related workshops to prepare the possible output of the main session.

(d) In addition to the traditional orientation session for newcomers on the first day, an orientation session will be held each morning to inform participants of the substantive agenda and to help them navigate the busy schedule of the IGF.

(e) As an experiment, a short taking stock session will be held on the second and fourth day of the meeting.

(f) An Open Forum with an open microphone session will provide an opportunity to all participants to address any issue of their concern.

(g) The final day will wrap up the IGF and will hold the traditional closing ceremony.

20. Building on the discussions at the previous open consultations and MAG meetings and taking into account many suggestions from the broader IGF community, there was a general understanding that the Bali meeting should encourage innovative formats in all meetings and, above all, enforce the previously accepted principle to reduce the number of panelists and to maximize interaction amongst participants.

21. Much time was spent on discussing the workshops and assessing the more than 150 full workshop proposals that had been received and evaluated by the MAG. The MAG was responsive to concerns expressed in the stocktaking process of the previous meeting with regard to the overall number of workshops. Many commentators had felt that there had been too many workshops and too many parallel tracks that had diluted the overall coherence of the programme. However, during the open consultations preceding the MAG meeting some commentators held the opposite view and felt that it would be unfair to limit the number of workshops as long as there were sufficient rooms available to accommodate them.

22. The MAG further assessed the workshop proposals, taking into account the initial scoring that had been done. The workshops were either accepted, conditionally accepted pending a merger or a change in format, or were not selected to take place in Bali. In going forward, the MAG will work together with workshop organizers who were conditionally accepted to adjust the workshop(s) to better fit the overall program of the IGF.

23. There was a general agreement that, as a baseline, proposals that scored above a 4.42 average (on a grading scale of 1-6 used by the MAG) should be accepted, that would be more than 70 workshops. Based on the availability of rooms for workshops, open forums and dynamic coalitions, another 10 – 15 workshops could be accepted. It was agreed that some of them could be given 30 minutes slots for so-called “flash sessions”. This would increase the overall number of available slots.

24. Some concern was expressed that the MAG had not paid sufficient attention to newcomers to the process, and in particular to newcomers from developing countries. It

was agreed that efforts should be made towards achieving a greater diversity among workshop organizers.

25. In designing the programme, the Secretariat was asked try to avoid having workshops over-lap with the main sessions as much as possible and try to streamline the schedule to make it easy for participants to follow in a coherent manner.

26. Moving forward, there was consensus that the MAG should increase its overall transparency by opening up its future internal communications to interested IGF stakeholders outside of the MAG.

27. In finalizing the programme, the MAG thematic group facilitators and the IGF Secretariat will work together online and use conference calls to further discuss the substance and scheduling of the main sessions. Workshop organizers will be contacted by the Secretariat and the MAG regarding the status of their workshops. Some will be asked to merge with others and some will be suggested to re-consider their formats.

ANNEX  
DRAFT SCHEDULE

Tentative Timetable	Day 0 – 21 October	Day 1 22 October	Day 2 23 October	Day 3 24 October	Day 4 25 October
			Orientation Session	Orientation Session	Orientation Session
0930-1230	PRE-EVENTS  (Ministerial Meeting)	Orientation Session <hr/> Building Bridges - The Role of Governments in Multistakeholder Cooperation	Focus Session (Access/Diversity):  Internet as an engine for growth and sustainable development	Focus Session (Security):  Legal and other Frameworks: Spam, Hacking and Cyber-crime (TIMING TBD)	Focus Session – Enhanced Multi-stakeholder Cooperation <hr/> Focus Session – Principles of Multistakeholder Cooperation
1400-1430					Taking Stock Session
1430-1730	(Ministerial Meeting)  Roundtable on National and Regional IGFs  Roundtable on Capacity Building	OPENING CEREMONY	Focus Session – Openness: Human rights, freedom of expression and free flow of information on the Internet <hr/> Focus Session: Internet Governance Principles –	Open Forum:  -Access/Diversity -SOP -CIR, -IG4D -Taking Stock	Emerging Issues <hr/> CLOSING CEREMONY
1730-1800			Taking Stock Session		

MAG meetings – May 2013

**List of Participants**

<b>Honorary Chair</b>	
<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Mr. Sastrosubroto, Sasongko Ashwin	Director General for ICT Application, Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (CIT), Republic of Indonesia

<b>Interim Chair</b>	
<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Mr. Kummer, Markus	Vice-President for Public Policy, ISOC

<b>MAG Members</b>	
Mr. Aizu, Izumi	Senior Research Fellow and Professor, Institute for InfoSocionomics, Tama University
Ms. Alexander, Fiona	Associate Administrator, National Telecommunications and Information Administration (NTIA), U.S. Department of Commerce
Mr. Al Shatti, Qusai	Deputy Chairman, Kuwait Information Technology Society
Ms. Amoroso das Neves, Ana Cristina	Director of the Information Society Department at the Science and Technology Foundation, Ministry of Education and Science in Portugal
Ms. Bommelaer, Constance	Director, Public Policy, Internet Society (ISOC)
Mr. Brueggeman, Jeff	Vice President - Public Policy and deputy Chief Privacy Officer, AT&T
Ms. Cavalli, Olga	Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Argentina
Ms. Charlmers, Susan	Internet New Zealand
Ms. Chaturvedi, Subi	Assistant Professor /Hon. Managing Trustee, Lady Shri Ram College For Women, Delhi University/Media For Change
Ms. Cretu, Veronica	President, CMB Training Center
Mr. Carvell, Mark	Special Adviser and Executive Coordinator, Global Internet Governance Policy, Department for Culture,

	Media and Sport
Mr. Chen, Hongbing	Chinese Mission in Geneva
Mr. Disspain, Chris	ICANN
Mr. Echeberria, Raul	Executive Director/CEO, Latin America and Caribbean Internet Addresses Registry (LACNIC)
Mr. Esmat, Baher	Manager - Regional Relations Middle East, Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers, ICANN
Mr. Glaser, Hartmut	Brazilian Internet Steering Committee

Mr. Guo, Liang	Director of the China Internet Project and Associate Professor, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences (CASS)
Ms. Hassan, Ayesha	Senior Policy Manager, Digital Economy, Executive in charge of ICT Policy, International Chamber of Commerce (ICC)
Ms. Kultamaa, Mervi	Counselor, Department for External Economic Relations, Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland
Mr. Major, Peter	Special Adviser, Permanent Mission of Hungary to the United Nations Office at Geneva
Ms. Mangal, Anju	Information and Knowledge Management Specialist/Coordinator, Secretariat of the Pacific Community (SPC)
Ms. Morenets, Yuliya	Founder and Representative, TaC -Together against Cybercrime
Mr. Mustala, Tero	Principal Consultant, Nokia Siemens Networks
Ms. Okite, Judith	Internet Governance Coordinator, Free Software and Open Source Foundation for Africa Dynamic Coalitions on Disability and Accessibility
Mr. Radunovic, Vladimir	Coordinator, Internet Governance Programmes, DiploFoundation
Mr. Ryan, Patrick	Policy Counsel, Open Internet, Google Inc.
Ms. Swinehart, Theresa	Verizon Communications
Mr. Spiller, Thomas	Vice President, Global Public Policy, Europe, Middle East and Africa, The Walt Disney Company
Mr. Wilson, Paul	Director General, Asia Pacific Network Information Centre (APNIC)

<b>Former host countries MAG members</b>	
Ms. Arida, Christine	NTRA-Egypt
<b>Remote Participants: MAG members</b>	
Ms. Aguerre, Carolina	General Manager, Latin America and Caribbean TLD Association (LACTLD)

Ms. Cambroner, Fatima	Argentina Study Group & Academic Research Association in Law, Economy and Business at Information Society
Mr. Pedraza Barrios, Ricardo	Director Business Development - Global Public Policy and Government Relations, VeriSign Colombia SAS
Ms. Seltzer, Wendy	Technical Team Privacy Identity policy, World Wide Web Consortium (W3C)

<b>Intergovernmental Organizations</b>	
UNECA	Mr. Faye, Makane
UNDP	Mr. Hajiye, Nariman
Council of Europe	Mr. Hibbard, Lee
UNDP	Mr. Talibov, Barat
OECD	Ms. Weber, Verena

<b>Indonesian Delegation</b>	
Ms. Firmansyah, Gerry	Secretariat of National ICT Council, Ministry of CIT
Mr. Harijadi, Djoko A.	Secretary of Directorate General of ICT Application, Ministry of CIT, Republic of Indonesia
Mr. Hasibuan, Zainal Arifin	Executive Team Vice Chairman, National ICT Council, Ministry of CIT
Mr. Moedjiono, Sardjoeni	Executive Team Member, National ICT Council, Ministry of CIT
Ms. Rizki, Ameliah	Legal and Cooperate Division, Secretariat Directorate General of ICT Application, Ministry of CIT
Mr. Saputra, Hendarwin	Indonesian Internet Service Provider Association

<b>Observers</b>	
<b>Governments</b>	
Brazil	Mr. Rosa, Carlos, Brazilian Mission in Geneva
Brazil	Mr. Romero, Rubens, Brazilian Mission in Geneva
China	Mr. Tang, Zicai, Ministry of Industry and Information Technology of China
Switzerland	Mr. Thomas, Schneider, Federal Office of Communication (OFCOM)
United States of America	Ms Franz, Liesyl

<b>Other Entities</b>	
Mr. Ashton, Nick	CLIA/IDEA
Ms. Aspasia, Sagiotis	-
Mr. Beccalli, Andrea	ICANN
Ms. Betancourt, Valeria	APC
Mr. Boyle, Martin	Nominet
Ms. Cade, Marilyn	Mcade
Ms. Cadena, Silvia	APNIC
Ms. Delgado Rosa	Judiciary Consultant
Ms. Doria, Avri	dotgay & APC
Mr. Drazek, Keith	Verisign
Mr. Guo, Feng	CATR OF MUT
Mr. Hilali, Abdelhaziz	ISOC Morocco
Mr. Jamil, Zahid	DNDRC/CSPA
Mr. Komarov, Mikhail	HSE, Russia
Mr. Langenegger, Matthias	CCIA
Ms. Lebrument, Chantal	Euroline
Mr. Mazzone Giacomo	EBU-UER
Mr. Peissik, Michel	Euroline
Ms. Poetranto, Irene	Citizen Lab
Mr. Pouzin, Louis	Euroline
Mr. Prendergagt, Jim	The Galway Strategy Group
Mr. Pupillo, Lorenzo	Telecom Italy
Mr. Sharp, Chip	Cisco
Mr. Shears, Matthew	CDT
Ms. Shckerbovich, Audrey	HSE
Ms. Weise, Constance	ICC BASIS

<b>Remote participants</b>	
Mr. Aboulyazed, Hicham	-
Mr. Davidson, Keith	-
Mr. Degeselle, Wim	Centre
Ms. Dickinson, Sam	-
Mr. Hamilton, Stuart	-
Ms. Hoferichter, Sandra	EuroDIG
Ms. Jaume-Palasi, Lorena	-
Ms. Karbach, Nadine	-
Mr. Kilnam, Chon	-

Mr. Owade, Victor	-
Mr. Williams, De	-

<b>UNDESA</b>	
Ms. Armstrong, Elia	Chief of the Development Management Branch at DESA's Division for Public Administration and Development Management (DPADM)
Mr. Cherkasov, Vyatcheslav	Senior Governance and Public Information Officer

<b>IGF Secretariat</b>	
Mr. Masango, Chengetai	Programme and Technology Manager
Ms. Badieli, Farzaneh	Consultant
Mr. Gutterman, Brian	Consultant
Mr. Sun, Lu	Intern
Ms. Vuillequez, Laura	Consultant