

# INTERNET GOVERNANCE FORUM

## Multistakeholder Advisory Group Meeting

Geneva, 14-15 May 2009

### Summary Report

1. The Multistakeholder Advisory Group (MAG) met in Geneva on 14-15 May 2009. The discussion was based on the agenda for the Open Consultations held on the preceding days and focused on the preparation of the Sharm El Sheikh meeting.
2. The MAG proposed "Internet governance – creating opportunities for all" as the overall title and agreed on the wording of an agenda to be proposed for the 2009 meeting. The proposed agenda is as follows:
  - Managing critical Internet resources
  - Security, openness and privacy
  - Access and diversity
  - Internet governance in the light of WSIS principles
  - Emerging issues
  - Taking stock and the way forward – on the desirability of the continuation of the Forum.
3. On the first morning, there will be a 'setting the scene' session, giving participants background on Internet governance in general and the IGF in particular. It will explain the functioning of the IGF and the issues it has been dealing with. The session will also give an overview of the programme. It will be followed by a session bringing in different regional perspectives, as they emerged from various regional meetings. Remote hubs will be given the opportunity to interact with the meeting.
4. The traditional opening ceremony/opening session will be held in the afternoon of the first day. It will be followed by a key note panel of two or three high-level personalities. The theme will be defined in light of the composition of the panel. The economic downturn or sustainable development and climate change were mentioned as possible themes for this session.
5. Managing Critical Internet Resources: This session will be held in the form of an open discussion in order to promote greater participation by all stakeholders to inform and provide a wide variety of perspectives. It will be managed by the Chair and moderators with resource persons on call in the audience. No relevant issue, however contentious, will be excluded from the discussions under this heading. The following issues were mentioned, among others, to be addressed under this heading: IP address allocation in general and IPv6 allocation in particular; the JPA, the IANA contract and the role of governments; the internationalization of critical Internet resources management; the importance of new TLDs and IDNs for development; enhanced cooperation.
6. Security, Openness and Privacy: The discussion of this cluster of issues will be introduced by a compact panel of practitioners to set the stage for the discussion and bring out options for how to deal with the policy and practical choices. The discussion should cover practical aspects of the coordination needed to secure the network (e.g. to fight spam.) Issues to be discussed will include the respect for privacy as a business advantage and issues such as identity theft, identity fraud, and information leakage. Another cluster included Web 2.0, social networks, cloud computing and privacy, e.g. control of one's own data and data retention. Other issues mentioned were cultural and technical perspectives on the regulation of illegal Web contents; regulatory models for privacy and cybersecurity. Some issues pertaining to openness were also discussed, including ensuring the open architecture of the Internet; Net Neutrality; enabling frameworks for freedom; ethical dimensions of the Internet.
7. Access and Diversity: This session will draw in the outcomes of workshops, which could compare and contrast approaches and best practices. Issues mentioned for this session included

national and international regulatory issues; national and regional backbones; infrastructure; interconnection costs, IXPs; modes of access and regulatory challenges; safety and redundancy of access, e.g. cable cuts; and issues in mobile access as well as multilingualism, IDNs and access for people with disabilities.

8. Internet governance in the light of WSIS Principles: This Session builds on the WSIS Principles, as contained in the Geneva Declaration of Principles and the Tunis Agenda for the Information Society. While some held the view that Paragraph 29 (“The international management of the Internet should be multilateral, transparent and democratic, with the full involvement of governments, the private sector, civil society and international organizations”) was particularly relevant for this session, others emphasized the importance of Paragraph 31 (“We recognize that Internet governance, carried out according to the Geneva principles, is an essential element for a people-centred, inclusive, development-oriented and non-discriminatory Information Society”). The Session will be based on Paragraph 72 i) of the Tunis Agenda which mandates the IGF to “promote and assess, on an ongoing basis, the embodiment of WSIS principles in Internet governance processes”. This session will be held in the form of an open discussion.

9. The morning of the last day will be reserved for the “formal consultations with Forum participants” on the “desirability of the continuation of the Forum” as stipulated by Para 76 of the Tunis Agenda. These consultations will be prepared by an online process, starting with a questionnaire prepared by the Secretariat and a rolling document synthesizing all commentaries received and posted on the IGF Web site. All contributions received by 15 July will be reflected in a synthesis paper that will be translated in all six UN languages as a direct input into the discussion of this agenda item. (Submissions received after that deadline will be posted on the IGF Web site on a continuous basis; however, they will not be reflected in the synthesis paper.)

10. Emerging issues: As in previous years, the last substantive session will be devoted to emerging issues. It should be a forward looking session with a focus on policy instead of technology. The impact of social networks was chosen as the theme for this session. This was also seen as a way to attract young people and bring them into the discussion, including through remote participation.

11. The MAG discussed holding round tables for issues where there is a convergence of views on the principles and the need for action. However, it was felt that this format would need further discussion and that it would be premature to introduce round tables at this stage. Instead, these slots would be given to merged workshops, provided they were sufficiently representative in terms of regional and stakeholder balance.

12. Other events:

(a) Workshops: Workshop proponents will be asked to consider merging with other, similar workshops or to flesh out their proposal.

(b) Merged workshops will be given the opportunity to bring their findings to the attention of the related main session. If sufficiently representative, merged workshops will be given three hour slots with the aim to identify best practices.

(c) Best practice Forums and Open Forums: A call for proposals for these events will be issued by the Secretariat.

13. A revised version of the draft programme paper, taking into account the discussions at the MAG meeting and at the open consultations, will be made available in due course. Stakeholder will be invited to send their comments on the paper.

14. The following deadlines were set:

15 June: submission of proposals for other events;

30 June: submission of speakers lists for workshops, open forums and best practice forums;

15 July: submission of comments on the “desirability of the continuation of the Forum”.

15. In light of the good progress made in defining the agenda and programme of the Sharm El Sheikh meeting the MAG decided that there was no need for holding open consultations and another MAG meeting in September. Instead, a meeting to discuss operational matters, open to all interested stakeholders and convened by the Secretariat, will be held instead. The meeting will take place on 16-17 September 2009 in Geneva<sup>1</sup>.
16. The proposed schedule is attached at Annex I.
17. The list of participants is attached at Annex II.

---

<sup>1</sup> The meeting will be held at the European Broadcasting Union, as originally planned for the open consultations and the MAG meeting.

Annex I

	Sunday 15 Nov	Monday 16 Nov	Tuesday 17 Nov	Wednesday 18 Nov
10:00 – 11:30	Internet governance – setting the scene	Managing Critical Internet Resources	Access and Diversity	Taking Stock and Looking forward – on the desirability of the continuation of the Forum
11:30 - 13:00	Regional Perspectives			
13:00 - 14:00	Lunch			
15:00 - 16:30	Opening Ceremony/session	Security, Openness and Privacy	Internet Governance in the light of WSIS Principles	Emerging Issues
16:30 - 18:00	Keynote panel			Closing Ceremony

**MAG MEETING 14-15 May 2009  
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Position</b>
<b>Chairman</b>	
Mr. Desai, Nitin	Delhi/Mumbai - Special Adviser to the Secretary-General for Internet Governance
<b>Members</b>	
Ambassador Alcaine, Miguel A	Geneva - Deputy Permanent Representative, Mission of El Salvador to the United Nations Office at Geneva
Mr. Al Shatti, Qusai	Kuwait City - Deputy Chairman of Kuwait Information Technology Society
Ms. Arida, Christine	Cairo - Director of Telecom Planning and Services, National Telecom Regulatory Authority, Egypt
Mr. Bajwa, Fouad	Lahore – Social Entrepreneur
Ms. Betancourt, Valeria	Quito - Coordinator of the Communication and Information Policy Programme in Latin America, Association for Progressive Communications (APC)
Ms. Cavalli, Olga del Carmen	Buenos Aires - Adviser for Technology, Ministry of Foreign Affairs Argentina
Mr. Dardailler, Daniel	Nice - Associate Chair for Europe, World Wide Web Consortium (W3C)
Mr. Disspain, Chris	Carlton, Australia - Chief Executive Officer, AU Registry; Chair, Council of Country-Code Names Supporting Organization (ccNSO)
Ms. Dryden, Heather	Ottawa - Senior Advisor, International Telecommunications Policy and Coordination, Telecommunications Policy Branch, Industry Canada
Ms. Fall, Coura	Dakar - Coordinator of GOREeTIC
Mr. Filip, Ondřej	České Budějovice - Chief Executive Officer of CZ.NIC (Czech Republic)
Mr. Gatete, Jean Yves	Bujumbura – Secretary-General, Collectif National pour le Développement Humanaire
Mr. Graham, Bill	Ottawa - Global Strategic Engagement, Internet Society (ISOC)
Ms. Handley, Cathy	Chantilly, VA - Director for Government Affairs/Public Policy, American Registry for Internet Numbers (ARIN)
Ms. Häll, Maria	Stockholm - Deputy Director IT Policy, Ministry of Enterprise, Energy and Communications, Sweden
Mr. Hansen, José Vitor	Brasilia - Deputy Head, Division of Science and Technology, Ministry of External Relations, Brazil
Ms. Hassan, Ayesha	Paris - Senior Policy Manager, E-Business, IT, and Telecoms, Executive in charge of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) Policy, International Chamber of Commerce (ICC)
Mr. Hilali, Aziz	Rabat - Professor, Institut Supérieur des

	Télécommunications de Rabat ; President, Internet Society Morocco
Ms. Hofmann, Jeanette	London - Senior Researcher, London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE) / Social Science Research Center Berlin
Mr. Katundu, Michael	Nairobi - Assistant Director, Information Technology Communications Commission, Kenya
Mr. Lau, Stephen K.M.	Hong Kong - Chairman, Electronic Data System (EDS)
Mr. March, Frank	Wellington - Senior Specialist Advisor, Digital Development Energy and Communications Branch, Ministry of Economic Development, New Zealand
Mr. McCain, Cecil	Kingston - Director of Post and Telecommunications, Office of the Prime Minister, Jamaica
Mr. Matulis, Aurimas	Vilnius - Director of the Information Society Development Committee, Lithuania
Mr. Moedjiono, Sardjoeni	Djakarta - Senior Adviser to the Minister of Communication and Information Technology of the Republic of Indonesia for International Relations and Digital Divide, Indonesia
Ms. Marrey-Bruce, Freda Ruth	Abuja - Senior Manager, Strategy & Monitoring, Nigerian Communications Commission
Ms. Nimpuno, Nurani	Stockholm - Outreach & Communications, Netnod/Autonomica
Mr. Papadatos, George	Geneva - Minister-Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Greece to the United Nations Office at Geneva
Ms. Piñeiro, Lorena	Santiago - Head of International Affairs Department, Undersecretariate of Telecommunications, Chile
Ms. Ms.Rodriguez Pereda, Katitza	Washington, DC – Director of EPIC’s International Privacy Project and Coordinator of The Public Voice Coalition
Ms. Primo, Natasha	Johannesburg - Coordinator, Association for Progressive Communications (APC) National ICT policy Advocacy Initiative
Ms. Selaimen, Graciela	Rio de Janeiro - Executive Coordinator, Núcleo de Pesquisas, Estudos e Formação (NUPEF)
Mr. Shanker, N. Ravi	New Delhi - Joint Secretary, Government of India, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology, Department of Information Technology
Mr. Siganga, Waudu	Nairobi – Computer Society of Kenya, Chair
Mr. Solines Moreno, Juan Carlos	Quito - Solines & Asociados Abogados, Partner; Professor of Technology & Law and Telecommunications Law, San Francisco de Quito University (USFQ)
Ms. Swinehart, Theresa	Marina del Rey, CA - Vice President, Global and Strategic Partnerships, Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)
Mr. Tang, Zicai	Beijing - Deputy Director, Department of International Cooperation, Ministry of Industry and Information Technology, China
Ms. Warren, Jennifer A.	Alexandria, VA - Vice President, Technology Policy & Regulation, Lockheed Martin Corporation

<b>Members participating remotely</b>	
Mr. Appasamy, David	Chennai - Executive Vice President, Sify Technologies
Mr. Echeberría, Raúl	Montevideo - Executive Director/CEO, Latin America and Caribbean Internet Addresses Registry (LACNIC)
Mr. Jamil, Zahid U.	Karachi - Senior Partner and Barrister-at-Law, Jamil and Jamil, Chairman Domain Name Dispute Resolution Center
Mr. Kārklīš, Jānis	Paris - Ambassador of Latvia to France and Permanent Representative to UNESCO
Ms. Taylor, Emily	Oxford - Nominet.UK, Director of Legal and Policy
<b>Intergovernmental Organizations and European Commission</b>	
Mr. Maloor, Preetam	ITU
Ms. Kim, Jeoung Hee	ITU
Mr. Fredriksson, Torbjörn	UNCTAD
Mr. Beccalli, Andrea	UNESCO
Mr. Hibbard, Lee	Council of Europe
Ms. Markot, Elisabeth	European Commission
<b>Regional Coordinators</b>	
Ms. Bu, Gracibel	GRULAC (Honduras)
Mr. Schneider, Thomas	WEOG (Switzerland)
<b>Advisors to the Chair and Others</b>	
Mr. Fältström, Patrik	Stockholm - Consulting Engineer, Cisco Systems; Member, Board of Internet Society; Member, Swedish Government IT Advisory Group
Mr. Glaser, Hartmut	São Paulo - CEO, CGI.Br
Mr. Kleinwächter, Wolfgang	Aarhus – Professor, International Communication Policy and Regulation, University of Aarhus
Mr. Kurbalija, Jovan	Geneva/La Valetta – Director, DiploFoundation
Mr. Mekawy, Yasser	Government of Egypt
Mr. Singh, Parminder Jeet	Bangalore – Executive Director, IT for Change
Ms. El Saadany, Nermine	Government of Egypt
Mr. Hassan, Yasser	Government of Egypt
Ms. Ismail, Manal	Government of Egypt
Mr. Yousef Mekkawi	Government of Egypt
Ms. Pandey, Tulika	Government of India
Mr. Mazzone, Giacomo	European Broadcasting Union
<b>Advisors to the Chair participating remotely</b>	
Ms. Shaw, Heather	New York – Director, International Telecommunications and Information Policy, United States Council for International Business

<b>IGF Secretariat</b>	
Mr. Kummer, Markus	Executive Coordinator
Mr. Masango, Chengetai	Programme and Technology Manager
Mr. Dufour, Daniel	Deputy Conference Coordinator
Ms. Doria, Avri	Consultant
Mr. Gichana, Joseph M.	Fellow
Mr. Arata, Seiiti	Intern