

IGF Argentina 2017

Argentinian Internet Governance Forum

- **General information:**

Date: November 16th and 17th, 2017

Venue: University of Buenos Aires - Faculty of Economic Sciences

Place: Uriburu 781 - Buenos Aires City, Argentina

- **Initiative's contact information:**

Email contact: secretaria@igfargentina.org

Secretariat coordinator: agustinacallegari@gmail.com and aguerre@udesa.edu.ar

Website: www.igfargentina.org.ar

Facebook: <https://www.facebook.com/igfargentina/>

Twitter: <https://twitter.com/igfargentina>

- **Summary**

For a second year, Argentina hosted its Internet Governance Forum (IGF), a space for dialogue on Internet policy and development issues. On November 16 and 17, almost 200 people from all stakeholders -government, civil society, academia, technical community and private sector- attended the event at the Faculty of Economic Sciences of the University of Buenos Aires,

The tensions between technology and human rights, the role of the Internet in the economy and the challenges to improve access and digital inclusion were some of the points highlighted both by speakers and participants throughout the various discussion sessions. New central topics for the future of the Internet such as the impact of the Internet of Things on society and algorithms governance and blockchain were also in agenda.

The event was sponsored by Google, Cablevisión-Fibertel, Facebook, Internet Society (ISOC), the Internet Governance Forum Support Association (IGFSA), the Argentine Internet Chamber (CABASE), the Regional Internet Registry for Latin America and the Caribbean (LACNIC) and the Internet Corporation for the Assignment of Names and Numbers (ICANN). The contributions made it possible to give fellowships to 13 people from 7 provinces to attend the event in person. The forum also had the support of the Center for Technology and Society of the University (CETYS) of the University of San Andrés, NIC Argentina and the Faculty of Economic Sciences of the UBA. The organization of the event was in charge of a Multistakeholder Committee integrated by representatives of all stakeholders involved in the processes of Internet governance.



- **Multistakeholder organizing team:**

Secretariat:

The secretariat of the IGF Argentina was conducted by the Center of Studies on Technology and Society - CETYS - (in Spanish, *Centro de Estudios de Tecnología y Sociedad*) of University of San Andrés. The Center was represented by Agustina Callegari, invited researcher at the University.

Multistakeholder Committee:

The Multi Stakeholder Committee of the IGF Argentina 2017, was integrated by two representatives of each stakeholder: civil society, academy, private sector, technical community and government.

- Martin Silva Valent (Datas - civil society).
- Javier Pallero (Access now - civil society).
- Miguel Montes (Universidad de Córdoba - academia).
- Javier Díaz (Universidad de La Plata - academia).
- Julian Dunayevich (NIC.ar - technical community).
- Julio Balderrama (SIG Cybersecurity - technical community).
- Esteban Lescano (CABASE - private sector).
- Paula Vargas (Facebook - private sector).
- Hugo Miguel (Ministry of Modernization - government).
- Cecilia Perez Araujo (Ministry of Modernization - government).

- **Preparatory meetings and process**

In 2017, the members of the Multistakeholder Committee were renewed. Each sector carried out an internal consultation within the organizations that compose it to renew or ratify their representatives. The opening process was notified by the official communication channels of the IGF Argentina. Half of the representatives (5) were renewed and the rest ratified their commitment to the national IGF. Since

its previous work for the organization of the Argentine Dialogue on Internet Governance (2015) and the 1st Argentine IGF, the University of San Andrés was chosen as the Secretariat of the event.

Once the Committee and the Secretariat were confirmed, the work for the organization of the IGF Argentina began. The Committee had regular meetings (approx. once a week) during the two months prior to the event. Most of the meetings were conducted remotely using Zoom.us.

A month and a half before the event, the Committee launched the call for scholarships for participants from the provinces. 90 applications were received. Taking into account the budget, the Committee selected 13 fellows. The arrangements for tickets and hotels were made by the Secretariat.

The Committee also held a public consultation to determine which topics the community was interested in and wanted to be discussed during the event. 29 responses were received and were taken into account for the agenda setting.

- **Budget**

In descending order, the sponsors of the IGF Argentina were:

- Google
- Cablevisión
- Facebook
- IGFSa
- Internet Society
- CABASE
- LACNIC
- ICANN

The University of San Andrés, as the secretariat of the IGF Argentina, was the organization that received all the funds and execute the budget. 70% of the budget was used to give fellowships to people of the provinces to allow them to come to the IGF. IGF Argentina 2017 had a total of 13 fellows from 7 different provinces. The fellows participated actively in the discussion and also contribute to the event by making the reports of each session.

- **Fellows**



The IGF Argentina received 13 fellows from 7 different provinces, which was essential to attain a national discussion and be able to address many issues people from Buenos Aires are not aware of. Moreover, it was an important opportunity for people from various provinces to get to know colleagues and organizations based in Buenos Aires.

The 13 fellows were:

Fernando Manuel Centeno (Corrientes)
María Florencia Rodríguez (Córdoba)
Sofía Agostina Batalla Troncoso (La Rioja)
Florencia Basso (Tierra del Fuego)
Jose Daniel Britos (Córdoba)
Moreno Ibañez Daniela (Córdoba)
Cristian Damian Cazon (Jujuy)
Nancy Karina Corzo (La Rioja)
Daniela Fernanda Araya (Córdoba)
Eduardo Omar Sosa (Misiones)
Darío José Macías (La Rioja)
Gustavo Daniel Díaz Fernández (Tucumán)
Pablo Javier Noriega Alcaraz (La Rioja)

- **Attendance statistics of the meeting**

Number of people registered: 491
Number of people attended: 189 personas
Remote participants: 60

Gender: Female: 81 / Male: 108

Stakeholder:
- Academia: 32

- Technical community: 15
- Government: 35
- Private Sector: 41
- Civil society: 44
- General public: 6
- Not specified: 16

• **Agenda of the meeting, with listing the speakers/presenters and main key points raised at each of the sessions**

Day 1		
	Main Room	Roundtable
09:00 a 10:30	Registration and coffee	
09:00	New participants meeting: the internet governance ecosystem Topics addressed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Introduction to the Internet governance ● Main stakeholders and topics 	
9.30	Youth IGF Argentina <i>Maia Levy Daniel (Cele - Youth SIG) and Antonella Perini (Asuntos del Sur - Youth SIG)</i> Rapporteur: Batalla Troncoso and Sofía Agostina	
10:30	Opening ceremony Government: Héctor Huici (Min. Modernización) Civil society: Valeria Milanés (ADC) Academia: Pablo Palazzi (UDESAR) Private sector: Ariel Graizer (CABASE) Technical community: Mariela Rocha (NIC.ar) Rapporteur: Eduardo Omar Sosa Topic addressed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Importance of the IGF Argentina for each stakeholder ● Role of each stakeholder in the internet governance ecosystem ● IGF Argentina in the context of the LACIFG and the Global IGF ● IGF Argentina in the context of other process (G20) 	
11.00	Digital economy in Argentina Moderator: Adela Goberna (ALAI)	Critical infrastructures and technical standards

	<p>Private sector: Martin Wasserman (Airbnb) Government: Oscar González (Ministerio de Modernización) International organization: Ady Beitler (BID) Academia: Celia Lerman (UTDT) Verónica Robert (UBA Eco)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Moreno Ibañez Daniela</p> <p>Topics addressed: This panel was focused mainly in the regulation of platform. In addition, the impact of emerging technologies on the future of work was highlighted as a key topic that needs further discussion.</p>	<p>Moderator: Carina Birarda (SIG ISOC Ciberseguridad)</p> <p>Government: Agustín Garzón (Gerente Ejecutivo de ENACOM)</p> <p>Juan Carlos Minuto Espil (Director General de Planeamiento y Universalización, Ministerio de Modernización)</p> <p>Technical community: Hernán Arcidiacono (ARNog)</p> <p>Civil society: Enrique Chaparro (Fundación Vía Libre)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Fernando Manuel Centeno</p> <p>Topic addressed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Different definitions of “Critical Infrastructure”. • The debate showed that there are different positions on what is a critical infrastructure (IC), which makes it difficult not only to define it but also to regulate it. • There was agreement that there are many different aspects and technological issues that intervene (communications, datacenter infrastructure, routing equipment software, IP) and all of them are critical for the correct function of the Internet.
13.00	Lunch	
14:00	<p>Human rights on the Internet</p> <p>Moderator: Javier Pallero (Access Now)</p> <p>Academia: Joana Faliero (UBA Derecho) Private sector: Eleonora Rabinovich (Google) Academia: Vladimir Chorny (R3D) Civil society: Bea Busaniche (Fundación Vía Libre)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Nancy Karina Corzo</p>	<p>Gender perspectives on the Internet</p> <p>Moderator: Dafne Plou (APC)</p> <p>Academia: Tamar Colondenco (Women in the Digital Ecosystem) Civil society: Alejandro Joma (Coordinador Legal de AMMAR) Civil society: Marina Benitez Demtschenko (Fundación Activismo Feminista Digital)</p>

	<p>Topic addressed:</p> <p>This session addressed key topics as regards the tensions between technology and humans rights. Each speaker had the chance to make a short introduction about one of the topics suggested by the moderator:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Dissemination of images without consent and the role of intermediaries; ● content regulation and the right to privacy; ● surveillance in the digital age ● freedom of expression and copyright. <p>For all stakeholders, human rights are essential to maintain an open and free Internet for all.</p>	<p>Rapporteur: Daniela Fernanda Araya (+)</p> <p>Topic addressed:</p> <p>This roundtable addressed two main topics as regards gender equality on the Internet:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● the access and use of technology by and for women, ● the challenges that the concept of revenge porn presents for women online.
15:30	Coffee Break	
16:00	<p>Open mic: Internet governance in Argentina main challenges</p> <p>Moderator: Andrés Piazza (Consultor)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Rodríguez María Florencia</p> <p>Topic addressed:</p> <p>During the open microphone, several topics were addressed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The role of the digital economy in relation to workers, trade, and the entry of new companies to the country. ● Interest in tax reforms in relation to technology platforms. ● The importance of education as a necessary tool in the face of technological development was mentioned. ● Interest in hearing more about the use of free software as an alternative for the user. ● Importance of the representation of the users in the IGF Argentina 2017. ● Proposal for the realization of the IGF 2018 in another province. Cordoba was proposed. ● Proposal for the creation of a virtual space to continue the discussion of the topics once the event is over. ● Recognition of the work of the IGF Argentina as a space for meeting and dialogue. 	
17:00	<p>The impact of Internet of Things (IoT) in Economy and Society</p> <p>Moderator: Paula Córdoba (INTEL)</p> <p>Government: Ricardo Pérez (Min. Modernización)</p> <p>Private sector: Emmanuel Jaffrot (CABASE)</p> <p>Academy: Carolina Aguerre (UDESAR)</p> <p>Technical community: Sebastian Bellagamba (ISOC)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Darío José Macías (+)</p> <p>Topic addressed:</p> <p>During this panel, there were concerns about the impact that IoT has in users -consumers and the use of their personal data. In addition, IoT and security (concept of security by design) was addressed.</p>	

18.00	End day 1

Day 2		
	Main Room	Roundtable
9:00	<p>Digital inclusion and access to the Internet</p> <p>Moderator: Paloma Szerman (GSMA)</p> <p>Government: Maria Eugenia Alonso (Dirección Nacional de Innovación Educativa. Ministerio de Educación)</p> <p>Academia: Miguel Montes</p> <p>Civil society: Martín Baldassarre (Interacción Accesible)</p> <p>Private sector: Hernán Seoane (CABASE)</p> <p>Technical community: Mariela Rocha (Nic.ar)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Pablo Javier Noriega Alcaraz (+)</p> <p>Topic addressed: The main issues addressed in the discussion were related to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Connectivity and infrastructure challenges to connect the whole country (last mile) • Affordability and Accessibility. • Contents: local content vs international content and its impact on Internet traffic. • Universal access funds. • Comprehensive plan for digital education: digital skills for the future. • Specific programs for people with disabilities. 	<p>Debates de Vanguardia: Gobernanza de Algoritmos y Blockchain</p> <p>Moderator: Martin Silva (Datas)</p> <p>Academia: Micaela Mantenga (UDES)</p> <p>Civil society: Rodolfo Andragnes (ONG Bitcoin)</p> <p>Private sector: Diego Fernández (Marval O'Farrell)</p> <p>Government: Hugo Miguel (Ministerio de Modernización)</p> <p>Rapporter: Florencia Basso</p> <p>Topic addressed: The main topics highlighted were: the governance of algorithms and the new technological trends such as Blockchain and bitcoin.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Algorithms bias and no neutrality • Algorithms black boxes • Importance of more debate and knowledge about algorithms. • Concept: Blockchain and its creation. • Bitcoin and its economical challenges. • Trust as a key for virtual currencies.
10:30	Coffee break	

11:00	<p>Cybersecurity</p> <p>Moderator: Julio Balderrama (SIG ISOC Ciberseguridad)</p> <p>Government: Hugo Miguel (Min. de Modernización) Private sector: Sergio Piris (Cablevisión)</p> <p>Civil society: Leandro Ucciferri (ADC)</p> <p>Academia: Lia Molinari (UNLP)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Cristian Cazon</p> <p>Topic addressed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concept of cybersecurity and the misuse of the word. Lack of consensus on its definition. • Different approaches to the topic: traditional approach vs innovative ones where all stakeholders are included. 	<p>Discussion about Convergence</p> <p>Moderation: Paula Vargas (Facebook)</p> <p>Private sector: Esteban Lescano (CABASE)</p> <p>Private sector: Carlos Bartol (ASIET)</p> <p>Government: Oscar González (Ministerio de Modernización) Ricardo Porto (Senado de la Nación)</p> <p>Civil society: Javier Pallero (Access Now)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Gustavo Daniel Diaz Fernandez</p> <p>Topic addressed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Importance of regulating towards the future and not for the past and challenges to do so. • Local regulation challenges (intermediaries liability bill)
12.30	<p>Closing Session: Balance and Perspectives</p> <p>Moderator: Agustina Callegari (Secretariado IGF Argentina)</p> <p>Academia: Miguel Montes (UNC) Civil society: Martín Silva (Datas) Private sector: Paula Vargas (Facebook) Technical community: Julian Dunayevich (Nic.ar) Government: Cecilia Pérez Araujo (Min. Modernización)</p> <p>Rapporteur: Jose Daniel Britos</p> <p>Topics addressed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Balance of the event: number of participants, sponsors, importance of the fellows, the work of the multistakeholder committee and the process of building the agenda. • Future of the IGF Argentina: engaging more participants, importance of the youth, relationship with the media, debate about having an annual event vs a permanent process and its challenges, proposals to organize the event in another province. 	
13.30	<p>End Day 2</p>	

The IGF Argentina 2017 had several multistakeholder panels and four roundtables that were held simultaneously, giving the possibility to the attendees to participate in the sessions that were of their interest. During each panel it was possible to ask questions, raise ideas or proposals after the speakers' presentation while in the roundtables. All attendees were part of the debate from the beginning. The event was attended by approximately 200 people and 60 remote participants.

The first day began with the Youth IGF Argentina session. During the presentation, the starting point was the definition of the concept of Internet Governance and the importance of the Multistakeholder model. Antonella Perini, Coordinator of the Political Innovation Academy of Southern Affairs, reinforced this position, stating that "the multistakeholder model allows us all to be together here on an equal footing."

IGF Argentina 2017 started with the Multistakeholder Opening Ceremony, with leaders from all stakeholders: the private sector, the National Government, academia, civil society, and the technical community. After the opening, the Digital Economy panel took place and several topics around the development of the digital economy in Argentina were discussed. Verónica Robert from CONICET said that "it is clear that the Internet must be regulated, but it must be in accordance with the country's development strategy" .

Simultaneously, the roundtable on Critical Infrastructures and Technical Standards was held. There Hernán Arcidiácono, representing ARNog (Argentine Network Operators Group), highlighted that "the Anycast project of NIC Argentina is an example of how to deal with critical infrastructure issues: in a collaborative way between actors", and Enrique Chaparro, from Fundación Vía Libre, indicated that "the norms are also part of critical infrastructures. That is why it is important how they are built from the social field, in addition to the technical one".

After lunch, the panel on Human Rights on the Internet: Promotion and Challenges, and the roundtable on Gender Perspectives on the Internet were held. In the latter, proposals were made and initiatives were introduced to address the challenges that technology presents for women empowerment. For example, in the words of Marina Demtschenko, president of Fundación Activismo Femenino Digital, "women without resources generally do not have legal access, and this even more difficult for digital rights". On the other hand, Tamar Colondeco from Women in the Digital Ecosystem (WIDE) affirmed that "the digital gender gap is increasing, and time will not be enough. In the '80s in the USA there were more women programmers than now. Today we see less presence and more violence against women."

In the afternoon, during the Open Microphone instance, participants had the chance to raise questions, make proposals, and bring ideas on how to improve Internet Governance in the country. The closing panel was The Impact of Internet of Things (IoT) on the Economy and Society. Carolina Aguerre, from University of San Andrés (UdeSA), expressed that "the future arrived. Internet of Things is already going through our daily life". Emmanuel Jaffrot, Manager at IoT SigFox at Grupo Datco, stated that " IoT seeks to generate technologies to solve problems in an adapted manner". Finally, Sebastián Bellagamba, Regional Director for

Latin America and the Caribbean at the Internet Society (ISOC), warned that "when creating these technologies, we must take into account the element of security in their design. The regulatory, legal, and rights frameworks must be clear. For the growth of IoT it is necessary to promote the development of data infrastructure."

The second day began with the Inclusion and Internet access panel, in which Miguel Montes, from the National University of Córdoba (UNC), said that multisectoral work is essential for digital inclusion." Mariela Rocha, representing the technical community, added that "it is not just a multi-stakeholder model, needs are raised from the bottom up and with consensus ". At the same time, the Roundtable discussion on Governance of Algorithms and Blockchain was held. Micaela Mantegna, representing University of San Andrés, explained that "the algorithms are not neutral. As a concept, they are a basic recipe that feed on our information and take on a predictive character." Rodolfo Andragnes, Founder of Bitcoin Argentina, in relation to the Blockchain stated that "if there is no trust, there is no value. If the data is not reliable, it does not help. "

During the Cybersecurity panel, Lía Molinari, from University of La Plata, indicated that "security is a transversal issue but we have a traditional approach", and Leandro Ucciferri, from Asociación por los Derechos Civiles, added that "there is a clear lack of consensus in the definition of the concept of 'cybersecurity'. Having clear concepts, will help us to define what are the roles of each stakeholder and facilitate the dialogue." In the roundtable Discussing Convergence, Javier Pallero, from Access Now, reflected "we are in a situation of innovation that challenges many paradigms", and Esteban Lescano, from CABASE, added that "we must regulate towards the future, which is why it is important to think about stakeholders that do not exist today, otherwise we would be limiting that this ecosystem of actors can develop."

Finally, the Closing Panel: Balance and Perspectives, was integrated by Miguel Montes (University of Cordoba), Martín Silva Valent (Datas), Paula Vargas (Facebook), Julián Dunayevich (NIC Argentina), Cecilia Pérez Araujo (Ministry of Modernization) and Agustina Callegari (IGF Argentina Secretariat). During this session representatives of the different stakeholders had the time to highlight essential aspects of the IGF Argentina, its challenges and future. In addition, Dr. Pablo Clusellas, National Legal and Technical Secretary, was part of the panel. He expressed in his speech his satisfaction for the organization of the IGF Argentina, and encouraged and supported organizers to continue with this initiative.

IGF Argentina at IGF

Carolina Aguerre, founding participant of the IGF processes in Argentina and researcher at CETYS - the center that acts as the Secretariat of the initiative by appointment from the multistakeholder community, participated at the NRI session at the 12th IGF in Geneva to share some of the main concerns that have been raised during the second edition, as well as more general concerns related with the low levels of participation of different stakeholder groups, both in the inter-sessional work as well as in event itself.

IGF in the local press

See, for example:

<https://www.unosantafe.com.ar/el-pais/una-falla-infraestructuras-criticas-puede-dejar-millones-internet-segun-expertos-n1507725.html>