Summary Report

on the Main/Focus Session titled

"Policies Enabling Access, Growth and Development on the Internet"

1. **Title**: "Policies Enabling Access, Growth and Development on the Internet"

2. **Theme**:

    (i)   The main session combines two key themes: "Access" and "Internet as an Engine for Growth and Development".

    (ii)   The objective of the session was to strengthen IGF's "knowledge agenda" by bringing forth diverse experiences, especially from developing countries, on policies that have worked to deliver access, learnings and how internet connectivity drives growth and development in developing countries especially for women, youth and the marginalized sections.

    (iii)   The session had a special focus on developing countries and women participants. Apart from ITU and UNESCO, panelists shared perspectives from Turkey (Chair), Nigeria, Kenya, Egypt, South Africa (Africa), Argentina, Brazil (Latin America), China, India, Sri Lanka (Asia), Pacific Islands, United States and Europe. The moderators and the youth volunteers represent Fiji, Kenya and UK. Of the 21 (TBC) invited (20 confirmed) panelists, 14 belong to developing countries and 2 to international organisations. 8 panelists are women.

    (iv)   ACCESS
    - There existed 1 billion internet users when the Tunis Agenda was conceived in 2005. In the next 9 years, at the time of UN IGF in Istanbul, according to a 2014 ITU report, (http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-D/Statistics/Pages/facts/default.aspx), there are approx. 7 billion mobile subscriptions and approx. 3 billion internet users. Of these 3 billion, 2.3 billion are mobile broadband subscriptions – half of which are in developing countries.

    - Home internet access is near saturation in developed countries, but only 31% in developing countries. By 2014 end, 44% of the world's households will have internet access. In contrast, in Africa, only 1 out of 10 households is connected to internet. Against Europe's internet penetration of 75% and Americas at (66%), Asia Pacific is at 32%, and Africa (19%) – up from 10% in 2010. By 2030, 3.1 billion new internet users will come from Asia, Africa (1.3 bn), Americas (0.5 bn) and Europe (0.1 bn).

    - Public internet access, infrastructure sharing and access as a human right for the socially disadvantaged, vulnerable sections and persons with disabilities are critical access issues – that need global attention.

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

(v)   INTERNET FOR GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT

- Several studies have established that internet contributes an average of 1.9 % to GDP - amongst developing countries. By comparison, in developed countries, it contributes 3.4 % of the GDP (http://www.mckinsey.com/client_service/high_tech/latest_thinking/impact_of_the_internet_on_aspiring_countries). Citizens are often the first to benefit in the developing countries especially through services such as email, social networks, search engines, access to information, education, health services, entertainment and important government content. Adoption of internet by the younger population drives online services. Women and SMEs are 2 of the beneficiaries of an increase in internet penetration.

- The panel will discuss both access and developmental issues with a special focus on "enabling policies".

3. **Schedule**: Day 2, Wednesday, September 3, 2014, from 9:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.

4. **List of contributors / volunteers for the main session**

- Olga Cavalli
- Hossam Elgamal
- Subi chaturvedi
- Virat Bhatia
- Ana Neves
- Yuliya Morenets
- Judy Okite
- Angelic Alihusain-del Castilho
- Thomas Spiller
- Olga Cavalli
- Shahram Soboutipour
- Tero Mustala
- Sardjoeni Moedjiono
- Patrick Ryan
- Ankhi Das
- Christine Arida
- Anriette Esterhuysen
- Patrick Ryan
- Marilyn Cade
- Jimson Olufuye
- Guy Berger
- Christine Arida
- Paul Rendek
- Peter Major

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

- William Drake
- S J Byun
- Cheryl Miller
- Claudia Selli
- Dr. Govind
- Dr. Ahmet E. ÇAVUŞOĞLU
- Ayesha Hassan
- Martin Levy

5. Preparatory process for Main Session (April-August 2014):

- Based on the consensus within the MAG and the decision to hold a session that would cover both subthemes of "Access" and "Internet as an Engine for Growth and Development", the preparatory process began on April 1, 2014.

- Pursuant to the decision, an introductory mail inviting comments on the issues of title, themes, potential speakers, moderators, broad areas of policy questions and a preparatory schedule was circulated to the MAG via email in mid-April.

- The title / theme were decided through a Doodle poll amongst MAG community.

- During the next 5 months, the organizers sent out 23 emails to the MAG community seeking and confirming the inputs on the above issues. Specific stakeholder groups were visited and revisited. Inputs received from MAG members in response to successive emails, were included in subsequent drafts.

- During the 2nd MAG meeting in Paris in May 2014, a brief presentation was made by the organizers in the face-to-face meeting. Inputs received from MAG members present at the meeting were again included in the subsequent draft.

- Starting June 2014, the IGF secretariat established dedicated lists for each of the main sessions. Following this drafts were circulated both on the dedicated and to the full list. Inputs received were incorporated in subsequent drafts.

- Care was taken to ensure that majority of speakers / panelists represented developing countries. Further, over 40% of all speakers on the panel were women. Additionally, gender, regional and multistakeholder balance was maintained when finalizing panelists, moderators, remote moderator and substantive rapporteurs.

- It was decided during the preparatory process that instead of the organizers, the substantive rapporteurs, appointed for the main session, would provide a brief 3 minute summary at the "Taking Stock" main session on Day 4 of IGF 2014. Substantive rapporteurs presented readouts as agreed.

- Detailed preparations were made regarding profiles of speakers. A list of policy questions was made available to the moderators / remote moderator for smooth functioning of the sessions. The moderators were also provided a recommendation on

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

the sequence, based on which panelists could be invited to respond to particular public policy questions.

- Name tent cards of all panelists, invitations and posters were prepared in advance and distributed before the session.

- It was decided that the session would be supported by 4 youth volunteers, who would distribute invites, and crowd source questions from attending delegates in coordination with the moderators.

- Each attending delegate in the main hall received a small card on which they could put down their questions / comments and hand it over to a youth volunteer for submitting to the moderators.

- The panelists were informed in advance regarding the policy questions which may be posed specifically to them. This helped them prepare short 3-4 minute interventions.

- There were a few last minute withdrawals of prominent speakers. These were replaced through a transparent, consultative process with the entire MAG and IG community. Every effort was made to retain gender, regional and multistakeholder balance while replacing a speaker. Frequent updates of the change in speakers were provided to the community.

- A screen timer was used during the session, which exhibited a 3 minute countdown on the screen, thus giving moderators and panelists a clear idea on when to close their comments.

- Emails were exchanged with panelists and calls arranged wherever requested, to ensure that all panelists, moderators and substantive rapporteurs were fully briefed before the session began.

- A last face-to-face preparatory meeting with moderators, substantive rapporteurs and youth volunteers was held on Day 1 of the IGF.

- Social media was used for crowed sourcing public policy questions. A Facebook page was created 3 weeks before the main session was held, to invite policy questions from the wider IG community. Questions and comments received on the Facebook page were included by the moderators in the session proceedings.

- Nearly every single comment received from the MAG community including speaker names, were included in the final list.

- It was decided that the substantive rapporteurs and youth volunteers would create 1 minute summary readouts of the main session, and when the opportunity presents, provide those readouts at the 10 "Access" workshops and 16 workshops which fell under the theme of "Internet as an Engine for Growth and Development", from Day 1-4.

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

6. Speakers

(i) Government:

Sl.#	Name	Title
1.	Ms. Omobola Johnson	Minister of Communications Technology, Government of Nigeria
2.	Ambassador Daniel A. Sepulveda	Deputy Assistant Secretary of State & U.S. Coordinator for Int'l Communications, United States Government
3.	Ms. Neelie Kroes	European Commissioner for Digital Agenda, European Union
4.	Mr. R S Sharma	Secretary, Department of Electronics & IT, Ministry of Communications & IT, Government of India
5.	Ms. Eugenia Migliori	Advisor, Secretary of Communications, Argentine Republic
6.	Ms. Salam Yamout	National ICT Strategy Coordinator, Presidency of the Council of Ministers, Government of Lebanon
7.	Mr. Jackson Miake	Office of the Government Chief Information Officer – Prime Minister's Office, Government of the Republic of Vanuatu

(ii) Civil Society

Sl.#	Name / Country / Reference	Title
8.	Dr. (Ms) Alison Gillwald	Research ICT Africa, South Africa
9.	Mr. Guo Liang	Director of the China Internet Project and Associate Professor, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, China
10.	Mr. Antonio Longo	Member, European Economic and Social Committee & Member of the Permanent Study Group on the Digital Agenda, EU
11.	Ms. Joana Varon	Project coordinator & researcher on Digital Rights, Center for Technology & Society / Fundação Getúlio Vargas Brazil
12.	Mr. John Walubengo	Dean, Faculty of Computing & IT, Multimedia University, Kenya & Board Member, AfriNIC

(iii) Technical Community

Sl.#	Name / Country / Reference	Title
13.	Mr. Jari Arkko	Chairman, IETF
14.	Mr. Raul Echeberria	Vice President, Global Engagement, ISOC
15.	Mr. Mike Jensen	Internet Access Specialist, Brazil APC, Brazil
16.	Professor David Reed	University of Colorado, USA
17.	Mr. Rohan Samarajiva	Chair, LIRNEasia, Sri Lanka

(iv) Private Sector

Sl.#	Name / Country / Reference	Title
18.	Ms. Dorothy Attwood	Senior Vice President, Global Public Policy, Walt Disney, USA
19.	Mr. Hossam El-Gamal	Board Member and Treasurer, AFICTA, Egypt

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

SI.#	Name / Country / Reference	Title
18.	Ms. Dorothy Attwood	Senior Vice President, Global Public Policy, Walt Disney, USA
19.	Mr. Hossam El-Gamal	Board Member and Treasurer, AFICTA, Egypt
20.	Mr. Rajan Mathews	Director General, Cellular Operators Association of India, India
21.	Ms. Funke Opeke	CEO Main One Ltd., Lagos, Nigeria

(v) **International Organizations**

SI.#	Name / Country / Reference	Title
22.	Mr. Getachew Engida	Deputy Director General, UNESCO
23.	Mr. Tomas Lamanauskas	Head, Corporate Strategy Division, ITU

7. Moderators:

(i)   Ms. Alice Munyua, Convener, Kenya ICT Action Network (KICTANET), Kenya

(ii)   Mr. Martin Levy, Network Strategy, CloudFlare, Inc., United States

8. Substantive rapporteurs:

(i)   Ms. Angelic del Castilho, Diplomat, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Government of Suriname

(ii)   Mr. Richard Allan, Vice President, Public Policy (Europe, Middle East & Africa), Facebook

9. Remote moderator:

(i)   Ms. Anju Mangal, Information Specialist/Coordinator for Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) and Information and Knowledge Management (IKM) activities, SPC-LRD, Fiji

10. Youth volunteers:

(i)   Vinay Kesari, India

(ii)   Varun Srivastava, UK

(iii) Octavia Kumalo, South Africa

(iv)   Eli Loeb, USA

11. IGF delegates' attendance and participation at the session:

(i)   The main session titled "Policies Enabling Access, Growth and Development on the Internet" was arguably amongst the best attended main sessions held in the main hall during IGF 2014.

(ii)   The main hall had a seating capacity of approx. 450. The session saw the hall near full or upwards of 400 delegates at any given point, across the 3 hour period.

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

(iii) Questions and comments from the session were coordinated through roving mike held by the youth volunteers. Comments and questions were placed on small cards provided to each delegate.

(iv) The remote moderator coordinated questions / comments from remote locations.

12. Highlights of the session

- Many stressed that the concerns over Internet access and inclusivity goes beyond the connectivity and infrastructure issues, but also incorporates the role of social inclusion in the debate, including users with disabilities and marginalized groups.

- One speaker noted that there is an It was also noted that the availability of local content is a key driver of Internet adoption. The need to place more emphasis on multilingualism online was also acknowledged by the panel.

- Participants recognized the value of cohesive educational systems as carriers of appropriate skills starting at primary school level - for example, coding.

- It was agreed by many on the panel that broadening the Internet governance discussion would enable other sectors and empower the multistakeholder model. This included finding ways to involve local and small enterprises in the policy discussion. It was stated that this aimed to help inclusiveness to the ecosystem, and at the same time empower such entities. One speaker also noted that the significance of youth empowerment in the policy formation debate is imperative in spurring economic and social development.

- The importance of standardizing how access levels are calculated was noted. It was argued that there are many different ways to do this, and views were expressed both in favour of more standardization and more local context sensitivity. It was suggested that an action to take from the session is to do more work looking at the different methodologies for calculating access levels and providing more transparency for these debates.

- Digital competencies and media literacy were seen by many participants as essential to Internet growth

- It was agreed that the involvement of governments in promoting and supporting infrastructure expansion through planning was imperative; however, there were differences in opinion about how the implementation of these plans should be monitored.

13. Presentation by substantive rapporteurs at the "Taking Stock" main session

(i) On Access

- **Richard Allan**: My name is Richard Allan. We had a 21-member panel, incredibly diverse, over 70% were from Developing Countries, and it was almost fully gender balance of male/female. And then the issue of connecting the next four billion people is one that we feel the whole community can gather around and can become a main

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

focus of work for the IGF over the next year. And I want to pull out three of the themes that were recurring themes through the debate on the access side of things beforehand go over to my co-rep to talk about more of the development side.

- The first thing was around calculating those who are connected and those who are not connected. Many of the debates around statistics or connectivity take place within a national context where everybody has an agreed framework. Here we were bringing different experiences together uniquely through the IGF and found we were not only comparing apples with pares, but apples with pares, with oranges, with apricots. Those that were connected and not connected and arguments were made both for one methodology to rule them all and for locally context technology through transparency. Through the debate we arrived at a place where there was a piece of work for the IGF, given the nature of this forum to work on transparency regarding what consequently constitutes such text as they go about the connection.

- Second issue is around, again, the big question there, I think, extent, the clear issues around content and competencies, the demand sites. And giving them locally produced content that creates the demand to take up the infrastructure. Many of these have to be focused on the infrastructure side. IGF is to look at the strategies, look at the extent to which versus infrastructure base, and then the effectiveness of different strategies. Then finally, themselves, the core agreement and arrive at how effective, and I think one thing that came through particularly which keeps that mechanism, the way in which Nigerian broadband strategies through a multi-stakeholder review group that needs regulating.

- Again, some work for IGF to look at natural broadband plan, which should be involved in assessing the effectiveness, and how do we ensure the broadband delivers.

(ii) **On Development**

- **Angelic Castilho**: I'm the co-rapporteur. I'm with development and growth. What we found is in the discussions usually when we talk about Internet policies for development and growth, they focus mostly on the infrastructure of development. That in itself is usually in competition again with other priorities, such as health, climate change, and this can be due to the fact that there is not enough awareness that Internet could be part of the solution of these competing challenges.

- In order to be successful, it's important to have a holistic approach. That was one important conclusion. A policy balance is needed in reducing the digital divide. And within reducing this digital divide, it's important that we realize that we have a need to have open access. We need to have open educational resources with special attention to be paid to media and information literacy.

- It's also important to realize that technology alone does not empower. The crucial needs are those of right contact, content, context, and competencies. It has also been shown that with improved infrastructure development, more local content becomes available. Of course there are certain enablers that benefit the creation of local content. There were a few mentioned, such as an environment that supports

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

creative and social expression and ability for political speech, rule of law, trust, protection for children, naming and addressing resources, digital scales and/or knowledge, which leads, of course, to capacity building. As was mentioned already by my partner rapporteur, is the requirement is competency.

- There are huge skill gaps between different parts of the world. This could be a reason why access to Internet is often missed as a possible solution to competing development priorities, as I said earlier. It is, of course, of great importance to focus on this gap of competence. And I think the IGF is really the forum for that.

- Our educational systems will have to be renewed, rebuilt, and to make people feel comfortable with the use of the tools for the intended purposes.

- In the light of this, there should have been special focus on the training of our teachers, and it could mean that the subject of coding has to be added to the curriculum of even private schools, as was mentioned. Other education-related institutions such as public libraries, have proven to be successful tools for the purpose of raising awareness and competence levels.

- Many feel that broadband access should be recognized as universal right and key to digital social inclusion. This especially also goes for those with disabilities and the aspect of multilingualism. To get this widely acknowledged, of course, and understood, more awareness needs to be raised and it has to be then done in a sense of security, trust, and I think generally the IGF can take this on. Another important aspects in the growth and development due to Internet is the participation and preparation of our youth. Net neutrality and respect for fundamental human rights remain crucial within this whole process.

- When this comes to the evolution of broadband, it has to be realized there is no one-size-fits-all. It's also important to note that access to Internet for growth and development should not focus mainly on infrastructure, as I said before. Open access creating the demand dealing with issues of privacy remain important.

- Thereby, we should not confuse access with personal access, but it should be about enabling people and motivating the production of local content. Government system should be digitized and available resources. Capacity building is key to sustainable development and meaningful participation. There are also other factors to consider such as the quality, as in the speed of Internet. Finally, the lessons learned, I have listed a few. One policy design done while inviting multistakeholderism collaboration, has proven successful.

- More sectors are needed in ICT government and business. There must be multilateral cooperation and we have to build on what works. Once policy is in place and private enterprise takes over, it's important that they engage local communities to provide options for sustainable development.

- Small enterprise has to be actively involved in the digital universe. One option is for example, to partnerships. There is, of course, much more to be said, but I hope that with the short summary I have provided an acceptable overview of this session.

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

14. List of Feeder Workshops

SESSION BY DYNAMIC COALITION

Sl. #	Workshop #	Workshop name	Date / Time	Room #
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 2, 2014 – DAY 1				
1.	N/A	Dynamic Coalition on Public Access in Libraries	09:00 – 10:30	10

SUBTHEME: ACCESS

Sl. #	Workshop #	Workshop name	Date / Time	Room #
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 2, 2014 – DAY 1				
1.	WS 74	Enabling Affordable Access, Changing Role of the Regulator	10:15 – 11:15	2
2.	WS 41	Policies to Promote Broadband Access in Developing Countries	11:00 – 12:30	5
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 3, 2014 – DAY 2				
3.	WS 208	Net Neutrality, Zero-Rating & Development: What's the Data?	09:00 – 10:30	5
4.	WS172:	Network Neutrality: A Roadmap for Infrastructure Enhancement	11:00 – 12:30	8
5.	WS 195	The Internet Age: Adapting to a New Copyright Agenda	14:30 – 16:00	4
6.	WS 169	Technologies and Policies to Connect the Next 5 Billion	16:30 – 18:00	7
THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2014 – DAY 3				
7.	WS 51	Connecting the Continents Through Fiber Optic	11:00 – 12:30	10
8.	WS 163	Building Alliances to Enhance Internet Affordability	15:45 – 16:45	7
9.	WS 70	Open Data and Data Publishing Governance in Big Data Age	16:30 – 18:00	8
10.	WS 99	Digital Inclusion Policies for the Forgotten Billion	16:30 – 18:00	1

SUBTHEME: INTERNET AS AN ENGINE FOR GROWTH AND DEVELOPMENT

Sl. #	Workshop #	Workshop Name	Date / Time	Room #
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 2, 2014 – DAY 1				
1.	WS 30	Internet & Jobs: Creative Destruction or Destructive Creation?	09:00 – 10:30	4
2.	WS 68	Small Island Developing States (SIDS) Roundtable	09:00 – 10:30	1
3.	WS 7	From Ideas to Solutions: Funding Challenges for Internet Development	09:00 – 10:30	9
4.	WS 89	Multi-Stakeholder Engagement: Imperative for	09:00 – 10:30	7

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

Sl. #	Workshop #	Workshop Name	Date / Time	Room #
		Accessibility		
5.	WS 65	The Role of IXPs in Growing the Local Digital Economy	10:15 – 11:15	8
6.	WS 15	Empowerment Displaced People Through Online Education Svc.	11:30 – 12:30	8
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 3, 2014 – DAY 2				
7.	WS 10	New Global Visions for Internet Governance, ICTs and Trade	16:30 – 18:00	6
8.	WS 206	An Evidence based Intermediary Liability Policy Framework	16:30 – 18:00	5
THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2014 – DAY 3				
9.	WS 136	Internet as an Engine for Growth and Development	09:00 – 10:30	3
10.	WS 159	Global Public Interest of the Internet	11:00 – 12:30	5
11.	Flash Session	Crowdsourced Solutions to Bridge the Gender Digital Divide	12:00 – 12:30	9
12.	WS 22	Clouds and Mobile Internet: Benefitting Developing Countries	14:30 – 16:00	5
13.	WS 3	Cloud Computing & M2M: Impacts for Emerging Economies	16:30 – 18:00	2
FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2014 – DAY 4				
14.	WS 171	Connecting Small Island States with Access to Data	11:00 – 12:30	4
15.	WS 194	New Economics for the New Networked World	11:00 – 12:30	2
16.	WS 198	Social and Economic Justice Issues in Global IG	11:00 – 12:30	3

15. Summaries for record and benchmark on Main Session on 'Access', 'Diversity' and 'Internet as an Engine for Growth and Development", held at:

(i) IGF 2013, Bali, Indonesia: Main Session titled "Internet as an Engine for Growth and Sustainable Development"

- The chair and moderator reminded participants that October 24th is UN day so it was an appropriate day to discuss the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), WSIS goals, and the correlation and interplay between them. 2015 is an important year, as it is when the international community will review its progress towards the achieving the goals adopted at the Millennium Summit in 2000. It also marked WSIS +10, which will entail an evaluation of the action lines adopted at Tunis in 2005. The focus session discussed how the WSIS decisions could feed into a review of Millennium Development Goals, and how technology could become an integral part of post-2015 Sustainable Development agenda.

- The session began with a presentation on Indonesia's response and implementation of the MDGs. Discussion reviewed Indonesia's successes and also areas where more hard work was required, such as in lowering the rates of infant and maternal mortality. The MDGs were integrated into the country's national mid- and long-term

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

development plans. The speaker introduced the post-2015 Sustainable Development agenda and the three pillars the agenda proposed: economic development, social inclusion, and environmental sustainability. Indonesia's approach was to address these pillars in a balanced and integrated manner, and through approaches that focused on partnerships between the main stakeholders.

- The next presenter, joining the session remotely, provided a history of the MDGs, describing the implementation of some of the issues and the development of the Sustainable Development goals, which are set to become the main conceptual framework for development in the 21st century. He stated that collaboration across all sectors involved in the wider development process would help deliver the agenda while working in silos would not; this observation was met with strong agreement.

- A number of speakers and members of the audience noted the limited reference to technology in the MDGs and that this must be updated in future international goals to reflect the ever-increasing importance of ICTs in development. A video was shown reminding the audience that the MDGs are really about people, and shared real examples of development activities that have been enabled by the Internet or made much more effective by the Internet.

- Building on the comments about the problems of a development agenda based around pillars, which soon risked becoming isolated silos of issues, the meeting agreed that the benefits of ICTs were cross-cutting. ICTs are general purpose technologies, which makes them enabling technologies much as the combustion engine or power generation enabled whole sectors to develop.

- A speaker noted how ICTs and particularly broadband deployment benefited from consideration through national planning efforts, such as national broadband initiatives that are developed as public-private partnerships rather than as public sector solo projects. Work produced by the UN Broadband Commission suggests that when governments act alone implementation tends to move more slowly and with less innovation than if the private sector and others were involved. Similarly, when broadband roll-out is left strictly to the private sector there are gaps that are not filled.

- It was also acknowledged that different models for promoting infrastructure deployment have been successful in different countries. Generally speaking, keeping Internet traffic local through investment in developing traffic exchanges was noted as a common goal. However, other models do exist and can work well. For example, Uruguay, which enjoys very high broadband penetration, illustrates that a single model was not always ideal. Rather than having a public private partnership arrangement, Uruguay's success stems from a state led model. Uruguay's relentless focus on building and making cable infrastructure available led to very successful uptake. Speakers were keen to point out that in different countries the answer might be to focus on wireless infrastructure and encourage entrepreneurial activity. There are different models for different situations.

- A presenter commented that he had been told that the successor document to the MDGs included only two references to the Internet. It was also mentioned that there was a tendency within governments for the departments responsible for ICT policy to

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

be different from those responsible for WSIS and UN arrangements and they did not necessarily communicate.

- The third part of the session had the goal of identifying possible recommendations to fulfill the aims of the WSIS and to make the connection to the broader Sustainable Development Goals, as both processes were to be reviewed in 2015.

- The Sustainable Development Goals Working Group will produce goals on water, energy, jobs, education and health. Gender is expected to be a goal or to be cross-cutting, and there might be other topics such as oceans, forests, peace and security. The session noted the importance of how ICTs will be included in the development of these global goals.

- A speaker noted the value of data collection, and how information about the full impact of the Internet –for instance, in the sharing economy, the caring economy and the app economy that have developed– are not being properly captured, documented and quantified in terms of the benefits they produce. If these benefits were documented then politicians and the public might increase pressure to have policies put in place to accelerate the Internet economy's development. The panel agreed on the significant value of improved data gathering and dissemination. Another speaker noted the importance of other infrastructures, particularly power, that are platforms essential to providing ICTs.

- Another participant commented on the need to share best practices, the need to communicate what works and past successes. Participants discussed options for the best place to share information and to discuss best practices and experiences. They wondered if the IGF might be the right repository for such information. A number of people noted that while the national and regional IGF initiatives were sources of important information, a universal challenge was to ensure these experiences were shared.

- The session was informed of a potential repository of materials from IGFs, regional events and other fora, a new initiative called "Friends of IGF". Launched this year in Bali, the Friends of IGF website project has collected the conversations, video, transcripts, presentations and other materials that have happened at IGFs over the past few years and has made it all available in one place. It was noted that such a site might be a very useful shared resource.5

- A speaker mentioned the U.K. government's 'Next Steps' paper, presented at the Seoul Cyberspace Conference earlier in October, and which attempted to generate greater consensus around Internet governance principles and how they should lead into model policies as part of a global capacity building agenda.

- A mind-map of the different topics, challenges and possible solutions was created during the session to provide a visual overview of the dialog and is available as an annex to this summary (Annex III).

- A key conclusion was that there is a need to strengthen the presence of ICTs within the post-2015 process, particularly the Sustainable Development Goals. Two additional clear takeaways from the session were the need to promote the collection and dissemination of new data and to share success stories and good practices. An

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

important lesson from the MDG process was the need to be more concrete in the formulation of goals, so as to be able to measure progress. It must be made clear that money goes where the goals are, and that when targets are not met there must be transparency about the outcome. Important questions were raised about data collection and how best to collect, analyze and share data in the future. This area, amongst others, is somewhere where the Internet has clear strengths and where it can contribute to accomplishment of the wider development objective.

(ii) IGF 2012, Baku, Azerbaijan: Main Session titled "Access and Diversity"

- The session addressed five main themes: infrastructure, the mobile Internet and innovation, human empowerment, the free flow of information, and multilingualism. These five themes were used to look at Internet access and diversity as a value proposition and the issues that needed to be addressed in order to transform the unconnected into empowered users, users into Internet creators and Internet creators into the innovators who would fuel the economic transformation and international development we desired.

- The first question asked who should pay for the infrastructure needed to meet rapidly growing demand. Government representatives on the panel, supported by other comments from the audience, highlighted the importance of public- private partnerships. As an example, four years ago, when the situation of broadband in East Africa was poor, the government of Kenya in particular supported and led initiatives to land fiber optic submarine cables and cheaper international bandwidth. This has since been the foundation of new national Internet infrastructure. Governments in the region also worked with the private sector to build a national broadband network between major cities and towns, extending to rural areas and across to land-locked neighboring countries. Where demand did not exist (or did not yet exist) to entice private sector partnership, the governments worked alone; for example, Kenya fully funded a national research network providing broadband to universities, which is now being extended to high schools and secondary schools.

- Another example that was raised was that of the Jamaican government acting as a catalyst for investment by producing favorable licensing and regulatory regimes that encouraged private sector investment. However, a number of comments noted that, in order to be sustainable, investment must be demand driven. Investment should be encouraged across the infrastructure chain, inter alia, from international and local bandwidth, to Internet exchange points, as well as favorable tax regimes, easing of import restrictions, and national policies that brought together agencies to support a common goal.

- An intervention from the floor emphasized that access needed to be addressed in a bottom-up approach to ensure all the diverse elements of a country and culture were considered. For example, India has 18 official languages and many millions of people with very dramatically different skills in terms of literacy, who are living in very different economic conditions.

- UNESCO noted the results of a recently completed survey that found a positive correlation between the volume of local content and Internet access prices: the more

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

local content you have, the quality of service will be better and the access price will be lower. The speaker noted this might seem paradoxical, but is what happens.

- Open government data was presented as an effective stimulus for mobile application development and innovation in services. Innovation hubs where young engineers and entrepreneurs can meet have sprung up across the African continent and represent new ecosystems supporting mobile development and start-up businesses. It was emphasized that mobile Internet had opened up opportunities for micro-enterprises and micro-entrepreneurs. They come from the grassroots, but are increasingly supported by sophisticated infrastructure such as 4G networks and high quality handsets and other mobile devices such as tablets, as well as open software development kits. Responding to a question from the floor, a panelist stated that with the quality of high-speed networks and new mobile devices, the mobile Internet was a satisfactory replacement for wired.

- The issues of women's rights and empowerment stimulated interesting debate, asking how access to the Internet can help women exercise the full range of their rights. The session heard that around two thirds of the world's population of illiterate adults is made up of women and that literacy is clearly a big issue in terms of access to the Internet. A panelist noted that programs were needed to provided technology to women not as passive users, but as active participators and creators.

- One of the three feeder workshops for the session reported on technology, economic and societal opportunities for women. Their discussions had focused on what was required to get women to have access; on education and skills building to empower women to get online; the challenges of cyber-crime and violence directed at women and how these can force women to stay offline, and, empowering women to overcome these challenges.

- A second feeder workshop described how libraries and other community services can deliver public access to the Internet. The discussions had explored how public access solutions could meet community needs, as solutions that took advantage of existing infrastructure, expertise and partnerships with the private sector.

- A third workshop reported on consumer rights and consumer protection, moving from the issue of gaining access to ensuring the quality of that access and asking if access to the Internet should be considered a new human right.

- Access in terms of accessibility for people with disabilities, including aging populations, was raised as a global challenge. It was highlighted that approximately 1 billion people were living with disabilities and this number is going to increase. Reference was made to a study by the International Labor Organization, which showed that the disabled people are more likely to be unemployed than able-bodied people.

- The English language dominated the Internet of the 1990s and early 2000s, but recent efforts were described that had given rise to a more multilingual global Internet. Most obvious has been the rise of Chinese Internet users, which has given Chinese language very strong prominence. The use of Chinese, Arabic, Cyrillic and other non-ASCII scripts has also been supported by technical developments such as

Main/Focus Session Report for IGF 2014, Istanbul, Turkey
Summary for the Main Session on 'Access' and 'Development'
Submitted by Virat Bhatia, Member of MAG 2014

internationalized domain names (IDNs); speakers noted IDNs as an important facilitator of language diversity on the Internet.

- A panelist described his government's efforts to preserve local, indigenous and endangered languages. The public broadcaster had long preserved content in different indigenous languages, but for many years had no platform to make them available. Digitization and online services are able to make such content available. However, conservation of local languages needs indigenous people to come forward and help the government and other bodies. The drive to preserve endangered languages has to come from people themselves, not left just to government to respond in a top-down manner.

- In closing the session, the chair presented research findings that a 10% increase in broadband penetration can lead to a 3.2 per cent increase in a county's GDP, along with a 2 per cent productivity increase. She noted that broadband Internet can play an important role in boosting the economy of a country as well as the wellbeing of citizens.

*** END OF WRITTEN SUBMISSION ***