IGF 2016 – BPF on IXPs
1ˢᵗ Virtual Meeting
20 July – 1 pm UTC

Summary

1. The 2016 Best Practice Forum on IXPs held its first open virtual (webex) meeting on 20 July 2016 at 1 pm UTC. The BPF IXP Coordinator, Ms. Salanieta Tamanikaiwaimaro chaired the meeting. The participants discussed the BPF's scope and goals, a work plan, and brainstormed on outreach to collect contributions to the BPF's content.

2. The webex recording of the meeting can be accessed at:
   https://intgovforum.webex.com/intgovforum/ldr.php?RCID=59c119017d5d02ed6edcad47fa04c26d

3. A draft document (google doc) on the scope and goals of the BPF and a work plan had been distributed for comments on the bp_ixps@intgovforum.org mailing list ahead of the meeting. A cleaned up version was sent to the list before the call (annexed).

4. It was recalled that the BPFs are intended to produce concrete outcomes highlighting best practices related to their specific Internet governance theme, to complement the other IGF activities. The BPF outputs are expected to be robust resources that can be widely distributed and built upon in other relevant processes. BPFs have the freedom to define their own methodologies tailored on their theme's specific needs and requirements.

5. It was emphasized that the BPF should not duplicating work done elsewhere but instead make use of the knowledge and expertise that is available in other places and organisations such as the IX Associations, the IXP Toolkit, PCH and individual IXPs. Reaching out and widening the group of contributors was seen as one of the main challenges for the 2016 BPF on IXPs.

6. Concern was raised that the BPF on IXPs should not limit its scope by aiming to contribute directly to one or more specific forums or processes. The outcome of the BPF should be a living and flexible resource intending to inform all kinds of policy debates on IXP related issues in a neutral way.

7. All agreed that IXPs can play a substantive role in achieving the UN Sustainable Development Goals by enabling access and contributing to an inclusive and sustainable growth. The BPF output should document and acknowledge the benefits of an IXP and put them into this perspective.

8. Participants agreed that the BPF outcome document should target relevant decision makers in the policy, business and regulatory environments. It was felt that after last year's focus on creating and setting up IXPs and identifying an IXP's stakeholders, it would be natural for this year's BPF to focus on growing and further developing an IXP after this initial period. When collecting best practices, the BPF should focus on policy and regulatory experiences and the mindset of the business community.

9. One participant said that experiences in his country had shown that efforts to regulate the IXP environment could have unintended consequences. It was suggested to address such issues with regulatory and licensing requirements in the BPF document. Another participant noted that reaching and educating the stakeholders in some rural and remote areas needs extra attention and might only be possible in the local languages. It was agreed to add small villages and remote areas as a focal point for this year's BPF on IXPs.

10. An indicative time line and work plan was presented (see draft document) which envisages an iterative process to develop the draft BPF outcome document based on the input and contributions received during the open virtual meetings, on the mailing list and during a public comment period. Drafts of the BPF outcome document will be published for comment well ahead of the IGF meeting in December.

11. Next steps:
   - The BPF's scope and goals will be review based on the input received.
   - All are invited to reach out to their networks and invite people to join the work of the BPF by subscribing to the mailing list and participating to the calls.
   - IXPs from all geographic regions are encouraged to share their experiences directly on the mailing list or with the BPF coordinators and consultant.
   - A doodle poll will be used to schedule the next call.

12. Practical information
   - BPF IXP webpage: http://www.intgovforum.org/cms/best-practice-forums/bpf-ixps
   - BPF IXP mailing list: bp_ixps@intgovforum.org
      (Subscribe at http://mail.intgovforum.org/mailman/listinfo/bp_ixps_intgovforum.org)

- summary by Wim Degezelle

List of Participants

1. Jane Cofin
2. Cristian Copcea
3. Malcolm Hutty
4. Antonio Moreiras
5. Jon Nistor
6. Michael Oghia
7. Mauricio Oviedo
8. Kanumuri Raju
9. Kyle Spenser
10. Nico Tshintu Bakajika
11. Salanieta Tamanikaiwaimaro (BPF coordinator)
12. Wim Degezelle (BPF consultant)

Annexes

BACKGROUND DOCUMENT FOR SCOPE AND WORK PLAN

Introduction

In December, 2015, the United Nations General Assembly endorsed the remarkable progress of the Internet and information and communication technologies at the overall review of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS+10). As part of the outcome of WSIS+10, the General Assembly acknowledged the role of the IGF as a multi-stakeholder platform for discussion of Internet governance issues and decided to extend for another 10 years the existing mandate of the IGF.

The Role that the IGF plays in Bridging the Digital Divide
An intrinsical part of the endorsement of Internet Governance is the recognition since the Tunis Agenda of the role that Information Communication and Technology (ICT) holds towards bridging the Digital Divide. For more than 10 years, the IGF has been a catalyst for facilitating dialogue and sharing knowledge around key Internet public policy areas that were identified within the Report of the Working Group of Internet Governance in 2005. Over the course of the years, there have been numerous additions to emerging policy issues. However 10 years on, there are still numerous challenges that affect "Access", "Availability" and "Affordability" and Internet Exchange Points are a critical part of bridging the Digital Divide. There are numerous other factors that together with IXPs can contribute to stimulating local, domestic, national and regional economies but for the purposes of this Year's Best Practice Forum, a community of global experts seek to collaborate to engage in defining emerging tools, shared lessons, and building vibrant network of experts who seek to share their knowledge and best practices.

Calls for more Concrete Tangible Output of the IGF

As the IGFs progressed there were calls from the Working Group on Improvements to the IGF that called for the development of more tangible outputs to enhance the impact of the IGF on global internet governance and policy.

Creation of IGF Intercessional Work to Develop Tangible Outputs
The creation of Intersessional work such as BPFs were designed to enrich the potential for IGFs and to develop more tangible outputs that would enhance the impact of the IGF on global Internet governance and policy. The output of the BPFs are intended to become robust resources and to serve as inputs into other pertinent forums.

The Tunis Agenda sets the The Internet Governance Forum (IGF), which was called for in section 72 of the Tunis Agenda for the Information Society, brings people together from various stakeholder groups as equals for, in discussions on public policy issues relating to the Internet.
Origins of the BPF on IXPs.

In 2012, the UN General Assembly (UNGA) Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) Working Group on Improvements to the IGF published a report that called for the development of more tangible outputs to 'enhance the impact of the IGF on global Internet governance and policy'. To enrich the potential for IGF outputs, the IGF has developed an inter sessional programme of Best Practice Forums (BPFs) intended to complement other IGF community activities. The outputs from this programme are intended to:
• become robust resources; and
• to serve as inputs into other pertinent forums.

2015 BPF on IXPs

The 2015 BPF produced a Report on Internet Exchange Points Internet Exchange Points (IXPs), titled Enabling Environments for Establishing sSuccessful IXPs which explained why IXPs matter, and it focused on ways to create enabling environments that allow IXPs to develop and flourish. It identified the main stakeholders of an IXP and collected best practice examples of how IXPs cope with challenges in their environment.

The 2015 BPF on IXPs described a range of good practices of which starting and developing IXPs can select depending on their local situation and needs. The BPF outcome document means to serve as the foundation of a flexible framework – useful regardless of the country or continent – for creating an environment that fosters IXP success and development.

2016 BPF on IXPs

The IGF 2016 (6-9 December, Guadalajara, Mexico) will be organised under the overarching theme and title **Enabling Inclusive and Sustainable Growth** is the overarching theme of the 2016 Internet Governance Forum that will be held in Guadalajara, Mexico between 6-9 December, 2016.

How can we as an IXP BPF move to enabling more inclusive and sustainable growth?

As the world moves towards increasing connectivity, it is envisaged that 20 billion devices are forecasted to be online within five years notwithstanding challenges to online freedom, security, trustworthiness and accessibility for all. There are estimates that the economic contributions of the internet will be as high as $4.2 trillion this year according to the 2015 Report of the Global Commission on Internet Governance.

 The Report further mentions that the Internet of Things (IoT) could result in a growth of $11.1 trillion in economic grains by 2025. The Internet is perceived as more than an economic engine but is a platform for innovation, freedom of expression, culture and access to innovation. Its unique design, enables innovation at the edges. However, there are most countries that still struggle with access, availability and affordability of the Internet whether it is through lack of access or poor access, nil to poor quality of service levels and extremely high costs of access due to extremely high interconnection costs or lack of IXPs that cause unnecessary clogging of international pipes that do not not need local traffic taking up unnecessary space which eventually the average consumer has to pay for.

There is a need for the BPF to be aware of what work is being done simultaneously by other Forums so as to minimise duplication and where relevant that it could provide input into.

Global Forums on IXPs

- The ITU Council Working Group decided that Open Consultations were to be convened on "With a view to discussing the establishment of Internet Exchange Points (IXPs) to advance connectivity, improve service quality and increase network stability and resilience, fostering competition and reducing interconnection costs as proposed by Opinion 1 of WTPF-13 and consistent with PP-14 Resolutions 101 and 102, stakeholders are invited to elaborate and examplify on challenges faced and identify widely accepted best practices for the design, installation and operation of IXPs. Physical Consultation meeting took place on 28th September, 2015, visit here.

- The ITU Council Working Group on International Internet-related Public Policy Issues(CWG-Internet), following Council Resolution 1344 (Mod.2015) decided on 18th February to hold an open consultation which ends on 11 September 2016 (online and physical) on the following topic: Building an enabling environment for access to the Internet:
- What are the elements of an enabling environment to promote internet connectivity;
- What are the elements of an enabling environment to promote an affordable internet?
- What are the elements of an enabling environment to promote the quality of access to the internet?
- What are the elements of an enabling environment to build confidence and security in the use of the internet?
- What is the role of Governments in building an enabling environment?

. By lowering service delivery costs, improving performance, and increasing reliability, IXPs can play an important role in enabling inclusive and sustainable growth in their communities and contribute to the achievement of the UN's Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

Call for Contributions on Scope of BPF 2016 Work

Draft Problem Statement

1. **How have IXPs contributed to Inclusive and Sustainable Economic Growth?**
A. What are Case Studies that show tangible evidence of inclusive and sustainable economic growth?
B. How have these IXPs contributed to the growth of local content?
C. How have these IXPs impacted on innovation?
D. How have IXPs impacted the economic growth of the country/region?
E. How have IXPs impacted on accessibility, availability and affordability?
1. **New and existing IXPs like to look at existing IXPs and point at the factors that made these IXPs successful. To cover the diversity of IXPs, the BPF wants to take different perspectives.**
A. Geographic perspective:
1.   Isolated areas (small island, landlocked countries, …)
A. Development perspective
1.   Developing countries, big cities, etc
A. Regulatory environment
1.   Strongly regulated, not regulated, etc
A. Other perspectives (tbd)

2. For those who wish to sign up to join the IXP BPF, [deleted text]

3. To subscribe to the BPF Mailing list and to participate in the work of the BPF. Kindly note that the work of the BPF is voluntary and pro bono.

Calling for Volunteers and Experts to Join BPF Intersessional Work on IXPs

The Co-Chairs of the 2016 BPF are pleased to invite volunteers and experts to join the BPF Intersessional Work on IXPs.

Proposed Structure and Work Plan

1. Discuss Problem Statement and Scope of BPF 2016;
2. Scope to be finalised on 20th July 2016;
3. Call for Volunteers and Experts to Join BFP on IXPs to close on 30th July 2016;
4. Call for Input into key focal areas amongst members of the community to go out on 22nd July 2016 and close on 4th August 2016;
5. Writing begins 4th August 2015 to compile output and first Draft to be ready for first round of Public consultations on 14th August, 2016 which closes on 28th August 2016;
6. 2nd Draft with Community Consultations incorporated to be published on 30th August, 2016;
7. 2nd Draft subjected to Peer Review by Internet Governance Experts (IXP Specialists/Economists/Regulators/Policy Specialists) and feedback by 7th September 2016.