Introduction

As of 2016, nearly 50% of the global population is connected to the Internet. The confluence of technology, knowledge, and rapid advances in robotics and knowledge management are contributing to a “4th industrial revolution”. As the technical and social impact of cyberspace accelerates, the question of how this domain should be governed has become paramount. The absence of direct state intervention to date has been one of the reasons for the Internet’s rapid global expansion and prominent role in the global economy. At the same time, as the global population gets online, the need for Governments to become involved – to provide basic safety and security – has also risen in importance. Countries need the Internet to drive economic development. The private sector needs a stable and favourable regulatory environment that favours innovation and investment. Citizens need a safe and secure cyberspace to ensure that economic and social benefits can be achieved and sustained.

Central Asia stands at the forefront of this global debate between security and development. Situated between Europe and Asia, the region has much to gain from the 4th Industrial Revolution. But, it also is a region with many significant regional conflicts, which are sources of cyber insecurity. There is much at stake in the process as states, institutions, and individuals in the region establish mutual trust, rights, and responsibilities for the cyber era. Striking a balance between Security and Development was the main theme of the 2016 Central Asian Internet Governance Forum.

The first Central Asian IGF took place in Bishkek (Kyrgyzstan) on June 21,22 with support of ICANN, ISOC, IGFSA, The SecDev Foundation, Public Foundation “Civil Initiative on Internet Policy”, the Regional Commonwealth Communications, Kaspersky Labs, and the Government of Kyrgyzstan.

The Forum agenda included the following themes:

The Future of the Internet: National and Global Approaches

The discussion will focus on cyberspace governance from international and national perspectives. The speakers will address global trends and main developments in Central Asia, including technological breakthroughs and evolving regulatory processes.

Experts will discuss whether existing models of Internet development are sufficient to ensure both sustainable growth, and safe and secure cyberspace.

To what extent countries, institutions and individuals are prepared to work together to develop Internet? How could Internet regulation adapt and evolve in relation to cybersecurity challenges, without undermining economic activity and innovation? The session will examine the potential of Central Asian countries to propose new models for Internet governance. What approaches might work better for future Internet?

The Role of DNS Industry in Central Asian Economies
In recent years, a noticeable decrease in the dynamics of domain industry development can be observed across Central Asia. Some analysts contend that this trend is occurring due to exit of large companies from CA markets, as a result of the global financial crisis. Others, however, believe that the problem has developed because national registrars do not see or fully comprehend goals and requirements of various players in this field, thus hindering DNS market development. In addition, the absence of tools and mechanisms for registrars’ performance evaluation, including indicators evaluating standards and content development, may be contributing factors as well.

The roundtable discussion will address various approaches aimed at strengthening the DNS industry, including analysis of specific steps, experiences of CIS countries and best global practices.

**Infrastructure and Access Technologies**

All countries are concerned with identification of effective approaches that lead to maximization of benefits stemming from the introduction of digital technologies. At the same time, various initiatives associated with complex infrastructure projects cause modifications to management systems, affect horizontal integration and shift relations between relevant actors. In such circumstances, what are the best models for infrastructure development projects?

The roundtable discussion will address main trends and existing options for such projects in Central Asia, as well as measures aimed at reducing the disparity between centre and periphery or various age groups. A specific focus will be placed on discussing projects dealing with modernization of existing ICT infrastructure to provide high-speed access for remote towns and rural areas.

**Digital Inequality and Internet Innovations in Central Asia**

«Digital inclusiveness» is not only an issue of a mere technical ability to access Internet, but also an issue of relevant skills and economic opportunities. A nation’s inability to provide equal access to information and networks, leaving poor citizens with fewer opportunities and limited access to digital services, has a direct impact on national progress overall.

The sessions participants will discuss specific conditions the creation of which could improve access to Internet for economically disadvantaged families; the role of Internet innovations in digital inclusiveness; benefits which Eurasian countries could obtain through the promotion of new technologies; and, requirements for stimulating innovation and economic development.

**Maintaining the Balance Between Internet Freedom and Security in Central Asia**

The discussion will focus on measures that increase trust in Internet, and development of a balanced approach between basic rights (e.g. privacy) and responsibilities that ensures innovation of cyberspace for all citizens.
The participants will address issues related to the scope and breadth of regulatory frameworks required to ensure the balance between growth and innovation on one hand, and stability and security on the other. What is required to ensure an adequate level of Internet security that encourages its further use and development?

The balance between individual rights, economic growth and collective security requires broader involvement of all interested parties, including governments, corporations and civil society. The session will address various challenges, comparable experiences and solutions from Europe, North America and Eurasia.

**National Cybersecurity Strategies**

Cybersecurity is often perceived as a strategic issue of national importance that touches on all segments of society. A dedicated government policy typically serves as a framework for ensuring stability of national information systems, whereas National Cybersecurity Strategy represents a specific model designed to address specific national cybersecurity issues.

The discussants will address some of the main approaches related to development of national cybersecurity strategies and exchange views on:

- Planning and design of the required policies and regulatory mechanisms;
- Definition of objectives and methods for developing state capabilities and legislative support allowing states to participate in the international fight against cybercrimes;
- Development of a systemic and integrated approach to national cybersecurity risks management;
- International cooperation;
- Development of a program aimed at ensuring security and resilience of existing, and future systems and services (e.g. intelligent peripherals)

**Economic Growth Through Development of Internet**

Attention of participants will be drawn to the influence of Internet on national economic growth, social development and education.

While sharing best practices and case studies stemming from the Internet's positive economic effects and rapid transformation of cyberspace in different countries, panellists will discuss whether Chinese and European experiences can be replicated in Central Asia. Could countries in the region achieve more? What has worked, and what is missing?

**Critical Infrastructure Protection**

A modern society is highly dependent on a reliable delivery of utility services, information technologies, and mobility of people and resources. Significant disruptions, even if short-term, in normal functioning of critical infrastructure and services may lead to very serious outcomes.
The discussants will address common global trends and approaches aimed at ensuring critical infrastructure protection, in the context of national cybersecurity strategies; development of solutions that balance state and corporate interests; identification of key assets, services and interdependencies, as well as measures that could be taken to neutralize threats or mitigate their occurrence.

**The Role of Government in Internet Regulation**

Until recently, lack of a direct government intervention was one of the primary reasons behind Internet’s rapid development and its growing role as a global economic catalyst. However, as opportunities and threats grow, so does a need for increasing government involvement in ensuring security of transactions and risk mitigation.

This roundtable will address issues related to collaboration between citizens and state, as well as better understanding of rights and governance, which increasingly acquire a more important significance. Good governance practices guarantee security and resilience of the system, while also ensuring greater predictability for private enterprise. Greater trust in Internet, along with privacy and property rights, are important prerequisites for maintaining innovating and safe cyberspace for all.

The discussants will focus on issues, such as how much regulation is needed to ensure balance between innovation and growth, and security and stability? What mechanisms are required to ensure Internet security without compromising users’ trust and their continued engagement in the network’s innovation?

The main purpose of the Forum was the creation of a public platform for the discussion of government policies regarding Internet governance in Central Asian countries. The Forum addressed issues related to cybersecurity, Internet freedom and regulation, development of the DNS industry and access to the Internet as well as global and national approaches to Internet governance.

Specialists in the field of Internet governance and development – representatives from Central Asian state authorities, telecommunications and ISP companies, research institutions and non-government organizations from around the world attended the event to discuss the most crucial topics for further development. The Forum was co-organized by the Ministry of Transportation and Communication of the Kyrgyz Republic and the Public Foundation «Civil Initiative on Internet Policy» with support from the SecDev Foundation (Canada), ICANN, Internet Society and IGF Support Association

Steering committee was organized based on participation of representatives of all interested parties to provide multistakeholder process of organizing IGF and guarantee balanced debates around IG issues.

**Steering committee members:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Stakeholder group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyzstan</td>
<td>Tattu Mambetalieva</td>
<td>PF “Civil Initiative on Internet Policy”</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>CSO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyzstan</td>
<td>Bayish Nurmatov</td>
<td>Institute of Electronics and Telecommunications</td>
<td>Chancellor</td>
<td>Academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyzstan</td>
<td>Nurbek Abaskanov</td>
<td>Association of Communication Operators</td>
<td>CEO</td>
<td>Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyzstan</td>
<td>Ernis Mamyrkanov</td>
<td>Ministry of Transport and Communication</td>
<td>Deputy minister</td>
<td>Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>Adil Nurmakov</td>
<td>Political sciences Ph.D, KIMEP University</td>
<td>Academic</td>
<td>Academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>Konstantin Gorozhankin</td>
<td>Kazakhstan Association of Internet and mobile commerce</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>Diana Okremova</td>
<td>PF “Law Media Center”</td>
<td>CEO</td>
<td>CSO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Asomiddin Atoev</td>
<td>Tajik Academic Research and Educational Networking Association</td>
<td>board member</td>
<td>Academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Rustam Kosymov</td>
<td>Association Small and Medium Businesses</td>
<td>member</td>
<td>Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Muhammadi Iboduloev</td>
<td>PF &quot;CIPI&quot;</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>CSO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Nodir Mirzoev</td>
<td>Head of the ICT Center, President office,</td>
<td>head</td>
<td>Government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Agenda of the 1st Central Asian IGF

Day 1

09.00 09.30  Registration, Coffee-break

**Openning Session**

Muhammetkaly Abylgaziev, First Vice Prime Minister of the Kyrgyz Republic

09.30 10.45  Avanessov Alexander, UN Resident Coordinator / UNDP Resident Representative in the Kyrgyz Republic.

Raul Echeberría, the ISOC, Vice-President

Sergey Kapinos, Ambassador, Head of the OSCE Centre in Bishkek

10.45 12.30  Plenary session: Future of the Internet: national and global approaches
### Roundtables

#### The DNS-industry in Central Asia

**Moderator:** Shavkat Sabirov, President of the Internet Association of Kazakhstan  

**Speakers:**  
- Ernis Mamyrkanov, Deputy Minister of Transport and Communications of the Kyrgyz Republic (Kyrgyzstan)  
- Nurlan Isin, President of Kazakhstan Association of IT companies (Kazakhstan)  
- Andrei Kolesnikov, expert, RIPN (Russia)  
- Kargapolov Yuri, a member of the Coordinating Council of the Association of enterprises Ukrainian network information center. (Ukraine)  
- Grigory Sagiyan, Vice-President of the ISOC-Armenia (Armenia)  
- Povalishev Sergey, Executive Director HOSTER.BY (Belarus)

#### Infrastructure and access technologies

**Moderator:** Abaskanov Nurbek, Executive Director of the Association of operators  

**Speakers:**  
- Abaskanov Nurbek, Executive Director of the Association of Communication Operators (Kyrgyzstan).  
- Taalai Baiterekov, director of the Government e-Government Centre (Kyrgyzstan)  
- Dmitry Burkov, Board Member, RIPE NCC.  
- Janko Dmitry, Senior Software Engineer Kyrgyztelecom (Kyrgyzstan).  
- Maarit Palovirta, the ISOC, Manager European region.
Plenary session: Bridging the digital divide, and Internet innovation in Central Asia

Moderator: Asomiddin Atoyev, TARENA

Speakers:

Chynara Suyunbaeva, ICT Coordinator for Development / e-governance, UNDP.

Kosymov Rustam, Director PF Internet (Tajikistan).

Chobanyan Hayk, deputy director of the Union of IT companies (Armenia).

Plenary session: The balance between freedom and security of the Internet in Central Asia

Moderator: Tattu Mambetalieva, Director, CIIP, Kyrgyzstan

Speakers:

Madeline Carr, professor of international relations (Cardiff University)

Elena Cherniavska, senior OSCE adviser on Freedom of the media

Sarkis Darbinyan, RosKomSvoboda (Russia)


Kozylyuk Alex, expert, Human Constanta (Belarus).

Coffee-break

Roundtables

National cybersecurity strategies

Moderator: Rafal Rohozinski
Director SecDev Group

Economic growth through the development of the Internet
Speakers:

Nezhurbida Sergey, Deputy Director of the Department of State Special Communications Service of Ukraine (Ukraine).

Shincariuc Paul, head of policy management in the field of information technology, Ministry of information technology and communication (Moldova).

Roman Kononov, Director of Center of Information Security (Kyrgyzstan)

Olzhas Satiev, Director of the Analysis Center and investigation of cyber attacks (Kazakhstan).

Vladimer Svanadze, Chairman of the Board Internet Development Initiative (Georgia)

Sergey Povalishev, executive Director HOSTER.BY (Belarus).

Shavkat Sabirov, President of the Internet Association of Kazakhstan

Moderator: Juliana Zinina, Director, Russia and Emerging markets, Microsoft.

Speakers:

Sabyrov Maksat, executive director of the Association of Software Services (Kyrgyzstan)

Iboduglu Gubad, Open Government Partnership (Azerbaijan)

Muhammad Ibodulloev, Director of PF “CIPI” (Tajikistan)

13.00 14.30

Lunch

Roundtables

Critical Infrastructure Protection

Moderator: Alexander Donos, ProDataLex

Speakers:

Vyacheslav Soltan, Head Inf.Tehnology and investigation of crimes in the field of informatics General procurator of Moldova (Moldova),

Valeriy Zubanov, commercial director, “Kaspersky Lab regional

Role of the State Internet Regulation

Moderator: Sarkis Darbinyan, RosKomSvoboda

Speakers:

Gregory Saghyan, Vice-President of the ISOC-Armenia (Armenia).

Diana Okremova, NGO Director Legal media center.

Asomiddin Atoyev, Tajik Academic Research and
office in Central Asia and Mongolia

Korneyko Alexander, president, Ukrainian Academy of cybersecurity (Ukraine)

Uliana Zinina, director, Microsoft Russia and Emerging Markets

Talgat Nurlybaev, President of ISOC Kazakhstan Chapter (Kazakhstan)

Kolesnikov Andrey, expert RIPN (Russian)

Martirosyan Samvel, Internet governance Board member (Armenia)

16.00 16.30 Closing remarks

All available presentations are posted on the official website of the forum www.caigf.org

During all 2 days of the event there was online translation available on Youtube links

Day 1 https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VdGlemCkFR4
Day 2 https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UaEtcvXrYBw

Summary

The objective of the first Central Asian IGF was the establishment of public forum for discussion of government policies regarding Internet governance in Central Asian region. Given common concerns about government encroachment on personal rights and freedoms, the Forum addressed issues in cybersecurity, Internet freedom, ICT regulations, access to information and global approaches to Internet governance. ONE’s intent was to introduce concepts that could lead to a more balanced approach in ICT governance, between security and development, while protecting fundamental human rights to information and privacy. The event and follow-up yielded the following results:

- High-level agreement and endorsement of Internet freedom principles, including the need to balance cyber security and policing of cyberspace with the protection of fundamental rights, including the right to privacy, data protection, and human rights.
High-level participation from Central Asian countries, delegations from Russia, Ukraine, Georgia, and Belarus, and representatives from civil society, independent media, private sector, as well as official delegations from Ministries of Communication, and Security Agencies. The event acted as a lightning rod for media attention, with over 18 print and online publications publishing content related to the conference.

High-level endorsement from regional organizations including OSCE, UN, ICANN, ISOC, RIPE NCC, RSS, and private sector actors including Microsoft, Kaspersky Lab, and Vimpelcom to establish (and support) the regional IGF as an annual event including all Eurasian countries, thereby creating an ongoing regional platform to address Internet governance issues.