



IGF 2018
Best Practice Forum on Local Content

IGF 2018
Best Practice Forum on Local Content

BPF output report

December 2018

Disclaimer:

The IGF Secretariat has the honour to transmit the paper prepared by the 2018 Best Practice Forum on Local Content.

The content of the paper and the views expressed therein are based on the BPF discussion and the various contributions and do not imply any expression of opinion on the part of the United Nations.

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	3
Executive Summary	5
1. Introduction	8
1.1. Framing the IGF Best Practice Forum on Local Content	8
1.2. Local Content	10
1.3. Focus of the 2018 BPF on Local Content	11
1.4. Methodology and acknowledgements	11
2. Developing a Local Content industry / value chain	13
2.1. Introduction - a sustainable local content value chain	13
2.2. “New models” and initiatives	14
2.3. Creating an enabling environment, creating opportunities	15
<i>Solving infrastructure issues</i>	15
<i>IDNs and Universal Acceptance</i>	15
2.4. Policy initiatives to promoting and supporting local content	17
<i>Development of new content and digitization analogue content</i>	17
<i>Improving skills</i>	18
<i>Prioritizing local content over International content</i>	18
<i>Modernizing legislation to adapt to the digital era</i>	18

3. Case studies	20
a. The deployment of a Community Network in Tusheti, Georgia	20
b. HUB Africa Project	21
c. Online educational platforms in the Armenian language	22
d. KASALA!	22
e. Teenager	23
f. God Calling	23
g. Proimágenes Colombia	24
Annexe - Meeting Report BPF workshop	25
Annexe - Internet Universality Indicators (UNESCO)	28

Executive Summary

The IGF Best Practice Forums (BPFs) bring experts and stakeholders together to exchange and discuss experiences and best practices in addressing Internet policy issues. The BPF on Local content was part of the IGF intersessional work programme leading into the 2018 IGF Meeting in Paris, France, on 12 - 14 November 2018. This report reflects the work of the BPF and is the result of a community-driven bottom-up and open process.

Local content is a returning topic at the IGF and considered to be a challenge that could benefit from continued cooperation and coordinated effort of all stakeholders. The 2018 BPF on Local Content builds on the work of the BPF in 2017 that discussed the relation between the development and growth of a local Internet and the availability of content and services that are relevant for the local Internet user. This year's BPF intends to take a next step and focus on the local development of content and a local content value chain

Local content and Internet uptake

Despite the rapid growth of the Internet and the considerable improvement of access in developing and remote areas, Internet uptake seems not to evolve at the same speed and keeps lagging behind in some areas. Access and cost directly relate to 'having the possibility to use the Internet', but it is the people's expectation and experience that the Internet brings useful and interesting content that motivates them to go online.

For the local Internet and in extension the local digital economy to develop, it is important that the content and services accessible and provided over the Internet are relevant for the local Internet user. Content must be in a language that is understood by the local population, and deal with matter of local interest. 'Relevant content, including which is generated locally and concerned with local issues, is necessary if people want to use the Internet in order to improve their quality of life or livelihoods, and to contribute to national development'¹.

Focus of the 2018 BPF developing a Local content value chain

Inspired by previous intersessional work and the discussions at the BPF Local content workshop at the 2017 IGF meeting, the BPF Local content in 2018 decided to focus on both enabling **'a sustainable local content value chain, and the economic viability of creating and providing locally relevant content'**.

¹ <https://en.unesco.org/internetuniversality>

The BPF observed three “realities” related to the local creation of local content:

1. New self-sustaining models for local content creation:
Local businesses, entrepreneurs, SMEs, etc. develop their own new models to create and commercialise content and be self-sustaining. New companies and start-ups are well placed to test innovative models, but also existing companies can search and develop new ways to create and commercialise local content.
2. The development of an enabling environment for local content creation:
Numerous policies, projects, and initiatives in all parts of the world contribute to the creation of an enabling environment for the development of a sustainable local content industry. There’s a broad spectrum of examples, such as IP legislation to protect online content of local creators², initiatives to provide affordable local hosting to local content producers³, etc., but also schemes and programmes providing support to start-ups, SMEs, etc. to help them become self-sustainable.
3. Existing models promoting, supporting or subsidizing local content creation:
Existing models in legislation, regulation, incentives, international or national policies etc. have as goal to promote, support, and subsidize the local creation of local online content. An important part of these models are particularly focused on or limited to the creation of local online content of a cultural and educational nation and the transition from traditional media to digital platforms.

The BPF Local Content organised a face to face session at the 13th IGF meeting in Paris. The testimonials and case studies presented at the session and highlighted in this report cover different aspects of the creation of local content and a local content value chain. The examples are selected from different regions and sectors.

Affordable and high-speed wireless Internet in small mountain villages in the **Tusheti region** in Georgia opens new opportunities for tourism and preservation of the local culture. It provides an essential information and communication channel for healthcare and in case of emergencies, and supports the economic sustainability of the region amongst other by creating opportunities for businesses offering local products and services.

Continuous work on **Universal Acceptance** to assure that domain names and email addresses in local non-ASCII scripts are widely accepted by applications is a fundamental requirement

² See also the work of the 2014 BPF Local content on this topic.

³ The lack of affordable local hosting and related issues are discussed in the report of the 2017 BPF on Local content.

for a truly multilingual Internet, one in which users around the world can navigate entirely in their local languages.

The **African HUB project** brings African broadcasters from different countries together. It allows to pool financial resources to invest in co-produced local content, obtain the rights on premium content for their region, and to coordinate and offer advertising opportunities for a pan-African audience.

The ‘Armenian Virtual College’ offers courses in the Armenian language and courses on the Armenian culture and literature; the project ‘Computers, Services and Wi-Fi Internet for Rural Libraries’ provides rural libraries with computers and Internet access and supports the creation of open e-libraries; the ‘TUMO Center for Creative Technologies’ created a platform for online studying. They are examples of **education opportunities in the Armenian language**, local content availability, and open educational sources.

KASALA! is a movie filmed in the streets of Lagos (Nigeria), self-produced and directed by Ema Edosio. **KASALA!** is now touring around festivals around the world having great success. The movie has been simultaneously distributed in cinemas and through digital and online tools, opening the ways to new forms of financing.

Teenager is a long running TV and web series on the different facets of the life of young people in Ivory Coast. The content of the episodes is based on input from young people across the region. A community of 120,000 adolescents is now developing into a market for ancillary products, such as music records from local artists.

God Calling is a 2018 Nigerian movie that is simultaneously released in movie theaters, shown in churches, and made available digitally and on DVD which opens the way to new forms of financing and helps to compete against piracy and traffic in illegal copies.

Proimágenes Colombia is a non-profit organization that administers the Film Development Fund (FDF) and the Columbian Film Fund (CFF). Both funds have proven successful at boosting the local film industry and the production of TV and more recently of webseries.

A recording of the workshop can be found here:

<https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/igf-2018-day-2-salle-xii-bpf-local-content> .

1. Introduction

1.1. Framing the IGF Best Practice Forum on Local Content

One of the key outcomes of the World Summit for the Information Society (WSIS) was the Internet Governance Forum (IGF). The IGF is a global forum where governments, civil society, the technical community, academia, the private sector, and independent experts discuss Internet governance and policy issues.⁴ The annual IGF meeting is organized by a Multistakeholder Advisory Group (MAG) under the auspices of the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN DESA). The 13th annual IGF meeting took place in Paris, France, from 12 to 14 November 2018.

The IGF Best Practices Forums (BPFs) bring experts and stakeholders together to exchange and discuss best practices in addressing an Internet policy related issue in a collaborative, bottom-up process. The BPFs are an answer to the call for intersessional work and more tangible outputs of the IGF.

The IGF Multistakeholder Advisory Group (MAG)⁵ approved local content as a topic for a Best Practice Forum leading into the 2018 IGF meeting. The BPF worked in an open and iterative way to produce this tangible best practice outcome.

Local content is a returning topic at the IGF and considered to be a challenge that could benefit from continued cooperation and coordinated effort of all stakeholders.

The **2014 Best Practice Forum on ‘Creating an enabling environment for the development of local content’**⁶ undertook an attempt to define ‘local content’ and studied what is needed to create an enabling environment from the perspective of users, the infrastructure and the law. In its conclusions, the 2014 BPF recommended to *‘encourage regional cooperation and collaboration by organizing and sharing existing case studies of local content production and capacity building. A repository of such content would be a useful resource for Internet users’*.

The **2017 Best Practice Forum on Local Content ‘Internet cultural and linguistic diversity as an engine for growth’**⁷ demonstrated that content and services that are relevant for the local Internet user can contribute to the development of the local Internet and local

⁴ IGF website: <http://www.intgovforum.org>

⁵ IGF MAG: <https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/about-mag>

⁶ BPF 2014: <http://www.intgovforum.org/cms/documents/best-practice-forums/creating-an-enabling-environment-for-the-development-of-local-content/412-bpf-2014-outcome-document-creating-an-enabling-environment-for-the-development-of-local-content>

⁷ BPF 2017: https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/index.php?q=filedepot_download/5005/1055

digital economy: “Content must be in a language that is understood by the local population, and deal with matter of local interest”.

The IGF’s **Policy Options for Connecting and Enabling the Next Billion - Phase I** (CENB I)⁸ observed that ‘the need to ensure that people are able to use the Internet according to their needs was reflected in many of the contributions. Providing access to the Internet is only the first step - once in place people must be able to use it. Ensuring availability and the ability to use applications, to stimulate the development of local content and services in all languages, and to implement strategies for safeguarding access to people with disabilities were some of the issues identified by the community.’

The IGF’s **Policy Options for Connecting and Enabling the Next Billion - Phase II** (CENB II)⁹ pointed out that providing meaningful access to the Internet requires ensuring that people can both consume and produce content, and that ‘access inequalities and barriers like content availability not only affect those in developing countries more profoundly, but also those in rural areas as well as cultural minorities, women, refugees, and disadvantaged groups.’ In addition, the CENB II identified several linkages between the United Nations’ Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)¹⁰ and the availability of content, amongst other with SDG 4 (Quality of education), and SDG 16 (Peace and Justice).

The IGF **Best Practice Forum on Internet Exchange Points (IXPs)** in 2015¹¹ and 2016¹² pointed at the two-way relation between locally stored local content and the growth and development of IXPs and the local Internet Infrastructure, contributing to a more affordable local Internet of higher quality.

The IGF **Best Practice Forum on Overcoming Barriers to Enable Women’s Meaningful Internet Access**¹³ listed the ‘availability of relevant content and applications as a barrier for meaningful access.’ Some of the testimonials in the report explicitly refer to the lack of available content in the local language.

In addition, local content has been the topic of numerous workshops and discussions at the annual meetings of the IGF since the first IGF in 2006.¹⁴ In these meetings content creators and other stakeholders from various countries and regions have talked about their experiences in bringing their projects to life.

⁸ CENB I: <https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/connecting-and-enabling-the-next-billion-phase-i>

⁹ CENB II: <https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/igf-2016-policy-options-for-connecting-and-enabling-the-next-billions-phase-ii>

¹⁰ UN SDGs: <http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>

¹¹ BPF IXPs 2015: <http://www.intgovforum.org/cms/documents/best-practice-forums/creating-an-enabling-environment-for-the-development-of-local-content/582-igf-2015-bpf-ixps/file>

¹² BPF IXPs 2016: <https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/bpf-ixps>

¹³ BPF Gender and Access 2016: <https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/bpf-gender-and-access-2016>

¹⁴ [IGF 2016, Local Content and Sustainable Growth](#); [IGF 2014, Creating an Enabling Environment for the Development of Local Content](#); [IGF 2014, Building Local Content Creation Capacity - Lessons Learned](#); [IGF 2013, Encouraging Locally Relevant Content to Grow the Internet](#)

1.2. Local Content ¹⁵

Despite the rapid growth of the Internet and the considerable improvement of access in developing and remote areas, Internet uptake seems not to evolve at the same speed and keeps lagging behind in some regions. Access and cost are only two of three factors affecting Internet growth. The third one is the availability of locally relevant content and services. Having the possibility to access the Internet is, by itself, not a sufficient motivation to go online. People start using the Internet because they expect and experience that the Internet is useful and interesting for them.

The final draft of UNESCO's proposed *Internet Universality Indicators*¹⁶ puts forward that 'relevant content, including which is generated locally and concerned with local issues, is necessary if people want to use the Internet in order to improve their quality of life or livelihoods, and to contribute to national development.'

For the local Internet, and in extension a local digital economy, to develop the content and services accessible and provided over the Internet must be relevant for the local Internet user. Content must be in a language that is understood by the local population, and deal with matter of local interest. Local content creators are best placed to understand what is relevant for their own community and local entrepreneurs well placed to target the local market with online services.

An enabling environment that facilitates, encourages and stimulates the development of locally relevant online content and services depends on different factors, amongst other the availability of content in the local language; the digital literacy and skills of the locals, and presence of support and guidance for those who need help; the possibility to monetize local content and services and related issues such as IP and copyright, and payment systems; the infrastructure for Internet access and local content distribution, and related, the availability of broadband, local hosting and Internet exchange points; access to information and freedom of expression; etc. The cost of access is a critical factor - when the only form of access is costly metered mobile broadband there is a strong chilling effect on local content creation.

The European model of the Public Service Media (that since 80 years organize a transfer of resources from the broadcasters to creative industries and creators and that is the largest financier of local production of contents in local languages (including in minority languages) is an interesting model to be considered. In some countries such as the UK and Italy the

¹⁵ The important role of relevant local content for the development of a local Internet, and in extension a local digital economy, was a length discussed by the BPF in 2017. For a more in depth discussion see the BPF Local Content 2017 output document:

https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/index.php?q=filedepot_download/5005/1055

¹⁶ <https://en.unesco.org/internetuniversality>

mandate of Public Service Media has been extended to cover the production of digital contents, in addition to the traditional production of TV and radio programmes.¹⁷

1.3. Focus of the 2018 BPF on Local Content

The 2018 BPF on Local Content builds on the work of the BPF in 2017 that discussed the relation between the development and growth of a local Internet and the availability of content and services that are relevant for the local Internet user. This year's BPF intends to take a next step and focus on the local development content and a local content value chain.

“The BPF intends to look at the needs of SMEs, startups, and content providers at the local and national level, as well as explore what hinders international and global providers of content and services from offering content in specific countries, regions and areas. Special attention will go to the developing countries’ perspective, both with respect to building up a local content ‘industry’ and enabling local users to access content offered by global providers.” (from proposal for a 2018 BPF on local content).¹⁸

The proposed UNESCO Internet Universality Indicators are also concerned with the availability of locally-generated content within and about the country, which should be assessed with reference to the proportion of individuals generating online content. In addition, it is said that ‘the availability of content in languages which are used by local populations is also critical to the value of Internet access, particularly for minority language speakers.’¹⁹

1.4 Methodology and acknowledgements

This document reflects the work of the 2018 BPF on Local Content. The BPF outcome document is the result of an open and iterative process during the months preceding the 2018 IGF meeting in Paris, France, 11-14 November 2018. The structure and the content of the document were developed through a series of open and collaborative discussions with interested stakeholders, on an open mailing list²⁰, virtual webex meetings²¹, and a BPF face-to-face meeting during the IGF in Paris²².

¹⁷ See UNESCO Convention 2005 - December 2017 meeting of the Intergovernmental Committee - Reports of civil society organisations on their activities (pages 48 to 61) DCE/17/11.IGC/6REV

https://en.unesco.org/creativity/sites/creativity/files/sessions/11igc_6_civil_society_reports_en.pdf

¹⁸ Proposal 2018 BPF on local content,

http://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/filedepot_download/6119/1188

¹⁹ <https://en.unesco.org/internetuniversality>

²⁰ https://intgovforum.org/mailman/listinfo/bpf-localcontent_intgovforum.org

A draft of this output document was published on the IGF website for public input prior and during the IGF meeting. The BPF Local Content workshop at the 2018 IGF meeting was an opportunity to engage with the IGF community present in Paris and participating remotely. Testimonials, discussions and feedback on the BPF draft document served as additional input for the final BPF output document.

Acknowledgements

This BPF Local content output document is the collaborative effort of many. We would like to recognise the IGF MAG for selecting Local content as topic for an intersessional Best Practice Forum in 2018; the BPF Coordinators Miguel Estrada and Giacomo Mazzone for proposing and leading the BPF; the IGF Secretariat and BPF Consultant Wim Degezelle for supporting the work of the BPF; the Panelists of the BPF workshop at the IGF meeting in Paris and Bertrand Mouiller for moderating the session; the numerous contributors to the document and participants to the BPF's deliberations on the mailing list, during the regular virtual meetings and at the workshop in Paris.

²¹ See meeting reports at <https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/bpf-local-content-0>

²² BPF Local Content workshop at IGF 2018, video and transcript at <https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/igf-2018-day-2-salle-xii-bpf-local-content>

2. Developing a Local Content industry / value chain

2.1. Introduction - a sustainable local content value chain

Inspired by its intersessional work and the discussions at the BPF Local content workshop at the 2017 IGF meeting, the BPF Local content in 2018 decided to focus on both enabling a **sustainable local content value chain, and the economic viability of creating and providing locally relevant content.**

The BPF participants, from different parts of the world and with different backgrounds, discussed how local content is created and what should be understood by a sustainable local content value chain. They observed three “realities” related to the local creation of local content²³:

1. New self-sustaining models for local content creation:
Local businesses, entrepreneurs, SMEs, etc. develop their own new models to create and commercialise content and be self-sustaining. New companies and start-ups are well placed to test innovative models, but also existing companies can search and develop new ways to create and commercialise local content.
2. The development of an enabling environment for local content creation:
Numerous policies, projects, and initiatives in all parts of the world contribute to the creation of an enabling environment for the development of a sustainable local content industry. There’s a broad spectrum of examples, such as IP legislation to protect online content of local creators²⁴, initiatives to provide affordable local hosting to local content producers²⁵, etc., but also schemes and programmes providing support to start-ups, SMEs, etc. to help them become self-sustainable.
3. Existing models promoting, supporting or subsidizing local content creation:
Existing models in legislation, regulation, incentives, international or national policies etc. have as goal to promote, support, and subsidize the local creation of local online content. An important part of these models are particularly focused on or limited to the creation of local online content of a cultural and educational nation and the transition from traditional media to digital platforms.

²³ BPF Virtual meeting I, 6 July 2018, http://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/filedepot_download/5005/1307

²⁴ See also the work of the 2014 BPF Local content on this topic.

²⁵ The lack of affordable local hosting and related issues are discussed in the report of the 2017 BPF on Local content.

These three “realities” are further discussed in the following sections and illustrated with experiences and best practice examples from different sectors and parts of the world.

2.2. “New models” and initiatives

‘The expansion in the use of mobile phones and other affordable devices has enabled a drastic reduction in both costs and working times across all the links in the value chain, which has been especially beneficial for new entrants - digital artists, self-distributing creators, electronic publishing houses, creative platforms, etc. All these are “born digital”, as it were, and are hence much faster than conventional players. The challenge encountered by these actors is not related to the need to migrate a traditional infrastructure and business model, but rather due to the fact that regulations are not always adapted to their way of working, and artistic recognition still tends to be overly tied to more traditional circuits.’²⁶ While the preceding text specifically relates to content creation of an artistic and cultural kind, this reality is also true for other types of local content creators.

‘In China, more than 600 films are made each year, but only around 300 of them make it to movie theaters. Many talented filmmakers don’t have an opportunity to produce movies.’ iQIYI - a Chinese provider of online content - started building a new ecosystem to share movies over the Internet. ‘This approach is giving many talented, well-educated and highly skilled young professionals and small companies an opportunity to produce films and to make money from their work.’ The users base of iQIYI is much larger than that of traditional TV stations or cinemas, what is a great opportunity to encourage young people to become real filmmakers.²⁷

Examples

- Supporting the collection and creation of online news: www.infobae.com and [Infobae Red de Periodistas](http://www.infobae.com/red-de-periodistas) ;
- Success stories of local content supporting the development of a local business: e.g. <https://www.youtube.com/user/locosxelasado> ;
- Youtubers in the Arab region, for examples Simo Sedraty or Mustapha El Fekkak alias Swinga²⁸,
<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC9JyBC7MshDg1uTyhm3UX3g>
<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC9JyBC7MshDg1uTyhm3UX3g>

²⁶ UNESCO Global Report 2018 - Cultural Policies in the age of Platforms, p 76

²⁷ iQIYI on China’s booming online film market,

http://www.wipo.int/export/sites/www/wipo_magazine/en/pdf/2016/wipo_pub_121_2016_05.pdf

²⁸ ‘Les youtubers marocains: Questions à Mustapha El Fekkak, Alias Swinga, youtubeur et créateur de séries web, <https://www.lavieeco.com/news/maroc/societe/les-youtubers-marocains-questions-a-mustapha-el-fekkak%E2%80%85alias-swinga-youtubeur-et-createur-de-series-web.html> ;
https://www.huffpostmaghreb.com/2017/03/07/video-aji-tfham-swinga_n_15195384.html

2.3. Creating an enabling environment, creating opportunities

Solving infrastructure issues

Several infrastructure issues can hinder or slow down the development of a local content value chain. For example the lack of affordable local hosting opportunities in many African countries hampers the local development of new content or limits the possibilities to digitise and bring existing local content online (e.g. existing analogue content of local broadcasters). Also the presence of one or more good working Internet Exchange Points (IXPs) in a country allows to handle local traffic locally and contributes to a reduction of the costs of the internet communication and an increase of quality and speed for users.²⁹

ASBU (Arab States Broadcasting Union) and AUB (African Union of Broadcasting) have signed an agreement to launch a platform of satellite IP based distribution of audiovisual contents, that will allow all countries of the continent to exchange contents through a very flexible and low cost and reliable infrastructure, based on the system called MENOS.³⁰

IDNs and Universal Acceptance

Universal Acceptance (UA) is the concept that all domain names and email addresses should be treated equally. Under universal acceptance, all syntactically correct domain names and email addresses are accepted, validated, stored, processed and displayed correctly and consistently by all Internet-enabled applications, devices and systems. Internationalized Domain Names (IDN), i.e. domain names in non-ASCII scripts, are a broad category of identifiers that require special processing that is not thoroughly implemented. UA is a foundational requirement for a truly multilingual Internet, one in which users around the world can navigate entirely in local languages.³¹

While at first sight the Email Address Internationalization (EAI) seems only loosely connected with local content, that is influenced only by universal acceptance of the IDNs, it should be noted that the major factor that hinders the sale and deployment of non-ASCII domain names is the fact that internationalized email addresses, that are associated with an internationalized domain, are rejected by most email applications. So, until the email servers

²⁹ See: 'The relation between local content, Internet development and access prices', UNESCO, OECD, Internet Society, 2011, https://en.unesco.org/sites/default/files/local_content_study.pdf ; and the reports of the IGF BPF on Internet Exchange Points (IXPs) in 2015 and 2016.

³⁰ See articles http://www.asbucenter.dz/schedule/asbudoc/1043-2018-tech_24/ASBU%20-%20Cloud_Feb_2018.pdf ; <https://www.uar-aub.org/single-post/2018/10/28/An-unprecedented-content-exchange-network-Un-r%C3%A9seau-in%C3%A9dit-d%C3%A9change-de-contenus> ; <http://www.newworklab.com/2016/10/29/5-conseils-de-simo-sedraty-aux-entrepreneurs/>

³¹ Contribution Microsoft to BPF Local Content, October 12, 2018

are all able to accept non-ASCII characters there will be no great motivation to buy an IDN and create a site on it.

In February 2015, the ICANN community created the Universal Acceptance Steering Group (UASG)³², tasked with undertaking activities that will effectively promote the universal acceptance of all valid domain names and email addresses. Since then, UASG has developed a library of documents for developers, IT professionals and educators spanning the breadth of UA-related topics and ranging from high level introductions to deeply technical specifications and best practices. Because of UASG efforts, stakeholders in India, Egypt, Brazil and elsewhere have developed training curriculum suited to their regions. UASG has also performed compliance testing of email systems, browsers and websites resulting in outreach and bug fixes.

Success relies not just on the outputs of the UASG, but also action by companies dedicated to the same values of worldwide empowerment. For example, Microsoft has offered products compatible with Internationalized Domain Names (IDNs) for many years; in collaboration with UASG, Microsoft now offers email solutions on multiple platforms that are compatible with Email Address Internationalization (EAI) standards and has assisted UASG in outreach to other email providers.

Also Governments can play a fundamental role in achieving universal acceptance of the Internet identifiers. One example is given by the Government of Rajasthan, who has launched a programme to provide all the resident population with an email address in the local Devanagari script³³. This is an incredible incentive to people to use the internationalized email, but also to IT companies to fix their products and allow the internationalized email address to be recognized as a valid one and processed accordingly by the email servers. A similar initiative is being considered by the Government of Serbia, in the framework of promoting the use of the Cyrillic alphabet.

This topic and these activities are a very relevant example to consider in the BPF's 2018 work. Increased use of IDNs will facilitate the creation of customized and relevant localized content for consumers in various countries and regions across the world, especially in developing nations with predominantly non-English-speaking populations. Similarly, increased support for EAI will reduce barriers to non-English-speakers maintaining an online presence using personal identifiers which are useful and meaningful to them and their communities. It should be noted that research commissioned by UASG³⁴ estimates that the increased opportunity from these technologies exceeds \$9 billion. Whatever the final sum may be, these practices clearly empower businesses and consumers alike by fueling economic development in regions which currently have limited choice with respect to linguistically and culturally tailored domain names and content.

³² <https://uasg.tech/>

³³ <https://currentaffairs.gktoday.in/rajasthan-state-offer-e-mail-ids-hindi-12201750775.html>

³⁴ <https://uasg.tech/2017/04/u-s-9-8-billion-opportunity-universal-acceptance-online-identities/>

Offline content servers are now being created with affordable equipment such as the \$35 Raspberry Pi to support access to and creation of local content in unconnected areas using the built-in Wifi of the server, smartphones and low cost tablets³⁵.

2.4. Policy initiatives to promoting and supporting local content

Development of new content and digitization analogue content

The UNESCO Global Report 2018³⁶ notes in a section on Cultural Policies in the age of Platforms, that : ‘At the production stage, the bulk of policies in recent years have focused on accelerating the modernization of specific sectors, such as books, music, film and video games. Broadly speaking, these measures have promoted the digitization of analogue industries, while encouraging the production of digital content and the consolidation of new enterprises through financial assistance and training.’

Under the title ‘Creative Content, Supporting creativity and innovation in local content production for television, radio and new media’ UNESCO’s Programme for Creative Content aims at increasing the production and dissemination of culturally diversified content in the media by providing training opportunities to content creators, supporting local content production and encouraging local content distribution channels.³⁷

‘Still today the largest part of local/national contents that facilitates societal development, cohesion, and democracy are supported and financed by institutions or companies using Free To Air transmission (FTA) to reach their audiences/citizens. The FTA model has been one of the engines that have allowed in Europe and in other parts of the world the flourishing of a sustainable form of audio-visual industry based on local creativity and able to provide local contents in the local languages. (...) [It needs] to be further explored and better defined in the next WSIS, IGF and similar fora, [how] to set up a replicable model that could be shared in order to ensure that access to Internet will guarantee access to local, useful and needed contents, suitable for each population across the world, without discrimination of education race, or wealth. Among other things, this would mean that conditions today guaranteed by the FTA model (guaranteed through DTT and satellite) will be replicated over the Internet.’³⁸

Examples:

- Since 2014 digital-only publishers and digital-only titles are eligible funding by the Canadian Book Fund;

³⁵ See for example: [1worldconnected.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/Project-Tawasol-Tunisia.pdf](http://worldconnected.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/Project-Tawasol-Tunisia.pdf)
<http://eduair.org> <http://solarspell.org> <http://kiwix.org>

³⁶ <https://en.unesco.org/creativity/global-report-2018>

³⁷ <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001447/144716eb.pdf>

³⁸ WSIS 2018, report of the workshop ‘Free to Air as the enabler of original local content’

- In 2016 France set up the Fund to Support the Digital Transition of Recorded Music, ‘with the aim of promoting the modernization of companies in the sector.
- 2020 Strategy ‘A Space for US All’ designed by CBC/Radio-Canada in 2014 to provide the national public broadcaster with the responsiveness and stability needed to navigate a rapidly evolving media environment - the programme has placed particular emphasis on the distribution of local content via mobile and web platforms.³⁹

Improving skills

Several countries and organisations take efforts to improve citizens’ skills when it comes to accessing and analyzing the digital content available to them.

The Osouklou project in Ivory Coast motivates schools to produce local content. The projects offers webspace to the schools and provides training to students to blog, so that they can produce the content for their schools website.⁴⁰

Prioritizing local content over International content

In some countries policy initiatives support the prioritization of local content over international content by local broadcasters.⁴¹

At the beginning of the year social network site Facebook announced it would start to prioritize local news and content in users’ news feeds. Facebook impliedly sees local news content as being more relevant and of higher quality than non-local content.⁴²

Modernizing legislation to adapt to the digital era

A recent WIPO study on the audiovisual sector in a number of African countries highlights that ‘piracy is perhaps the most intractable challenge confronting the audiovisual sector in the countries studied. In the digital age, piracy has graduated from black market DVDs to the sharing of films on USB drives and via social networks and online streaming services. It is affecting all distribution platforms, slowing the development of national audiovisual industries and threatening the livelihoods of creators.’⁴³

³⁹ Examples mentioned in UNESCO Global Report 2018 - Cultural Policies in the age of Platforms, p 74

⁴⁰ Montresor Konan at BPF Local Content call 18 September 2018. <https://www.osouklou.africa/>

⁴¹ see IGF Open Forum 2017 Local Content in the Media <http://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/igf-2017-day-2-room-xxi-of81-local-content-in-the-media>

⁴² Greg Sterling in <http://www.lsainsider.com/facebook-says-it-will-prioritize-local-news-in-the-feed/archives>, <https://www.adweek.com/digital/how-prioritizing-local-news-will-create-a-more-valuable-social-network/>

⁴³ http://www.wipo.int/wipo_magazine/en/2018/04/article_0004.html

The in 2016 proposed reform of EU copyright rules include measures ‘in order to foster a better balance in the remuneration of different actors in the chain, as well as greater transparency in contractual arrangements between creators and online platforms, and broader availability of copyright-protected content in the EU and across borders.’⁴⁴

⁴⁴ UNESCO Global Report 2018 - Cultural Policies in the age of Platforms, p 73

3. Case studies

The BPF Local Content organised a face to face session at the 13th IGF meeting in Paris. The testimonials and case studies presented at the session and highlighted here cover different aspects of the creation of local content and a local content value chain. The examples are selected from different regions and sectors.

A recording of the workshop can be found here:

<https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/igf-2018-day-2-salle-xii-bpf-local-content> .

a. The deployment of a Community Network in Tusheti, Georgia⁴⁵

The Tusheti region is located on the northern slopes of the Greater Caucasus Mountains on the border between Georgia and Russia, and is connected to the Internet since the end of July 2017. To bring Internet to the small mountain villages a network of transmission masts was installed, with the help of volunteers, on locations up to 3000 meters above sea level. In the villages Wi-Fi receivers were placed to capture the signal.

From the start of the project it was understood that providing access to the Internet would create an opportunity to be online, but not necessarily ‘connected users’. In 2016-2017 a pilot project together with the Georgian Innovation and Technology Agency (GITA) provided an e-commerce training programme with the aim to reduce the technical literacy gap between the urban and rural areas. The training focussed on basic Internet literacy and the development of travel and e-commerce sites. During the same period a project funded by the World Bank supported residents in the region to acquire the equipment needed to connect to the Internet.

Affordable high speed wireless Internet is now available in more than 33 villages in the Tusheti region, and Internet traffic is growing and will have tripled in 2018. The project opens new opportunities for tourism and preservation of the local culture, provides an essential information and communication channel for healthcare and in case of emergencies, supports the economic sustainability of the region and creates opportunities for businesses that want to offers and sell local products and services.

Georgian is a small language, spoken by 5 million people and using its own unique script. Overcoming the language barrier is a real challenge for the development of a local digital economy. E-commerce platforms are being created in Georgian for the own communities and in English for area guest.

⁴⁵ Case Study presented at the BPF workshop by Ucha Seturi, Telecom Operators Association of Georgia and coordinator of the project

More information;

- ‘Clearing a path to the outside world’, Tusheti case study, ISOC
https://www.internetsociety.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/TushetiCaseStudy_201701006_Final.pdf
- ‘Hauling the Internet to an Ex-Soviet Outpost High in the Caucasus Mountains’, NY Times
<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2018/01/05/technology/caucuses-mountains-internet.html>

b. HUB Africa Project ⁴⁶

The African public broadcasters, joined within the African Union of Broadcasting (AUB), in cooperation with the European Broadcasting Union (EBU) and experts of the Media Consulting Group started working on an innovative model to support qualitative local audiovisual production in Africa. Audiovisual and cinematographic production in Africa today suffers from a dispersion of funds. The limited budgets of African public broadcaster does not allow them to compete with international groups for premium rights, what impacts their capacity to monetize their program grids.

The main idea of the Africa HUB Project is to bring African broadcasters together, to work together, pool and choose what kind of programs they want to finance. The big advantage of this solution is that it does not cost more for each of the participating broadcasters while they can combine funds and territories. As such the HUB can function as a collective tool for

- Public and private bodies seeking a professional framework to manage their investments in audiovisual content, with the assurance that the content will circulate all over Africa;
- Channels seeking quality content, an bringing it to their territory, programming grids and resources;
- Advertisers seeking opportunities for pan-African audiences;
- Independent producers who need partners to fund new qualitative programs.

The HUB brings all AUB members together to pool resources for purchase and pre-purchase of programs. This offers multiple collective benefits:

- Several channels with limited budgets can pool their resources to secure the rights of premium content for each of their territories;
- The broadcasters can offer this premium content a unique audience, because only public national terrestrial channels are covering 100% of the countries where they have been historically established;
- This syndication would not break the potential to cooperate with other pan-African channels, while preserving the first window for for national channels;

⁴⁶ Case Study presentend at the BPF workshop by Alain Modot, on behalf of Grégoire Ndjaka, Association of African Broadcasters (AUB/UAR).

- This syndication allows to develop new content (edutainment, African telenovelas, formats, series, entertainment) by mobilizing new funding (donors and foundations, multi- and bi-lateral institutions, ACP Program, advertisers).
- The HUB will guarantee the technical expertise, professionalism, transparency, quality and service effectiveness that many international donors require and assures that content will reach the audiences for who it is intended.

African Broadcasting Union (AUB UAR)

<https://www.uar-aub.org/>

c. Online educational platforms in the Armenian language⁴⁷

The Armenian IGF 2018⁴⁸ discussed online education opportunities in the Armenian language, local content availability, and open educational sources. This session showcased three case studies:

- ‘The Armenian Virtual College’ - <https://www.avc-agbu.org> - a platform that offers courses in the Armenian language and courses on the Armenian culture and literature. The platform has almost 3000 subscribed students from within and outside Armenia.
- ‘Computers, Services and Wi-Fi Internet for Rural Libraries’ - <http://www.rural-libraries.am> - an Internet Society Armenia project that developed a lightweight library management software with an accessible user friendly interface, and provides rural libraries with computers and internet access and the creation of open e-libraries.
- The TUMO Center for Creative Technologies - <https://tumo.org> - a prominent educational center in Armenia’s capital Yerevan, which amongst other created a platform for online studying with courses for TUMO students and educational materials freely available to online accessible.

d. KASALA!⁴⁹

KASALA! is a movie filmed in the streets of Lagos (Nigeria) and self-produced and directed by Ema Edosio. KASALA! is now touring around festivals around the world having great success. The movie has been simultaneously distributed in cinemas and through digital and online tools, opening the ways to new forms of financing.

- KASALA! Trailer: <https://youtu.be/9Dib-sCyg0s>
- ‘Meet the Nigerian New Wave Director Behind the Film Kasala!’
<https://www.okayafrika.com/ema-edosio-nigerian-new-wave-movie-director-kasala/>

⁴⁷ Case studies presented at the BPF session by Ani Dallakian and Lianna Galstyan, bringing in input from a session at the Armenian IGF2018.

⁴⁸ <http://armigf.am>

⁴⁹ Case Study presented at the BPF workshop by Ema Edosio, Producer and Director of KASALA!

- *'Ema Edosio speaks, as Kasala comes to cinema'*
<http://thenationonlineng.net/ema-edosio-speaks-as-kasala-comes-to-cinema/>

e. Teenager⁵⁰

Since 2010 Teenager is a series on the different facets of the life of young people in Ivory Coast. After focussing on youngsters (age 10-18) in the first and second season, a third season is inspired by the life of young adults (18-25). Special for the production of Teenagers is that the series' content is based on input from young people, the main target audience. This input is collected via focus groups and a 'Call to Text' motivating online followers to express what kind of world they want to live in. As such the series Teenagers is more than only entertainment and also expresses an important message for policy makers and leaders.

- Trailer : <https://youtu.be/3be2xozqTGI>
- *'Teenager: une équipe de rêve'*
<https://www.abidjanshow.com/people/actu/teenager-une-equipe-de-reve-2>

f. God Calling⁵¹

The Nigerian movie 'God Calling' is at the same moment released in movie theaters, shown in churches, and made available digitally and on DVD. This is an answer to cope with the local situation of a very limited number of movie theaters for the large 100 million population and the flourishing circuit of copied DVDs that are sold on the streets. Fundraising for movies is often a problem, so rethinking the model to maximize the revenue is important.

- Trailer: <https://youtu.be/COTYIEtK1NY>
- *“'God Calling' Becoming a Movement, Seen As Most Anticipated Movie This Christmas'*
<http://xplorenollywood.com/god-calling-becoming-a-movement-seen-as-most-anticipated-movie-this-christmas/>
- *'God Calling set to hit cinemas, churches December 21'*
<https://guardian.ng/art/god-calling-set-to-hit-cinemas-churches-december-21/>

⁵⁰ Case Study presented at the BPF workshop by Jean Hubert Nankam, Producer, Ivory Coast

⁵¹ Case Study presented at the BPF workshop by Enyi Omeruah, Producer, Nigeria

g. Proimágenes Colombia ⁵²

Proimágenes Colombia is a non-profit organization that administers the Film Development Fund (FDF) (<http://convocatoriafdc.com>) and the Columbian Film Fund (CFF). Both funds have proven successful at boosting the local film industry. The columbian approach is based on public policy under which public resources can be accessed for the production of film. The FDF was established by the 2003 Film Act and CFF under the 2012 Colombia Filming Act.

The FDF collects a parafiscal tax and reinvests the resources on local film production. “Embrace of the Serpent”, a 2016 Oscar nominee for the Best Foreign Language Film category is a beneficiary of the FDF.

The CFF provides producers with a cash rebate for expenses paid on local film services.

- Proimágenes Colombia
<http://www.proimagenescolombia.com>
- Newsletter ‘Films in Figures’
http://www.proimagenescolombia.com/secciones/cine_colombiano/cine_en_cifras/cine_cifras_listado.php?lang=en

⁵² Case Study presentend at the BPF workshop by Gonzalo Laguado, Columbia

Annexe - Meeting Report BPF workshop

IGF 2018 Best Local Content -

Tuesday 13 November 2018 15:00 - 16:30 CET (UTC+1)

Session Organizer(s): Giacomo Mazzone, Miguel Estrada BPF Co-facilitators
Wim Degezelle, BPF Consultant

1. Introduction & background

- **Giacomo Mazzone**, EBU, BPF Co-facilitator, **Wim Degezelle**, BPF Consultant

Introduction to the BPF Local content and overview of the BPF draft output

2. Elevator Pitch presentations - the panel and their experiences

- **Ani Dallakian/ Lianna Galstyan**, the Internet Society, Armenia
- **Enya Edesio**, Award winning filmmaker and film director, Nigeria
- **Enyi Omeruah**, Music and audiovisual entrepreneur, Nigeria
- **Gonzalo Laguado Serpa**, Proimagenes Colombia, Columbia
- Alain Modot - on behalf of **Grégoire Ndjaka**, Association of the African Broadcasters AUB/UAR
- **Jean Hubert Nankam**, Producer of reality TV shows, documentaries, and drama, Ivory Coast
- **Roberto Gaetano**, ALAC , Italy
- **Ucha Seturi**, Telecom Operators Association of Georgia, coordinator of the Tusheti project, Georgia

3. Towards a sustainable local content value chain: facing difficulties, overcoming hindrances and achieving success

- Moderator: **Bertrand Moullier**, International Federation of Film Producers Associations (FIAPF)

4. Takeaways and closure [5 min]

Remote moderator: Lianna Galstyan /
Rapporteur(s) Giacomo Mazzone

AGREED PREMISE

The success of Internet in a community (apart of the availability of infrastructure) is determined by the availability of local contents and local services in local languages. More of these contents and services are available in a community, more successful the internet is.

KEY MESSAGES

1. In some parties of the world there are already existing and consolidated models that today guarantee a flow of resources (from TV and radio, film industry, publishers, etc.) to professional creators. In the developed countries these mechanisms are slowly moving to extend their action also to internet contents. In other parts of the world such kind of mechanisms doesn't exist or are very weak;
2. Face to the insufficient transfer of resources from the Internet platforms to local creators in local languages (especially in small countries), the most efficient way to improve the quantity and quality of local contents and languages over the Internet is to accelerate and facilitate the conversion of existing models into the Internet market. Cinema becoming digital and on line. TV and radio becoming digital and producing ad hoc contents for the on-line distribution. Printed media becoming digital publishers of web-based contents and services;
3. Effective national and regional laws could incentive this process of transformation, while International Treaties (such as UNESCO on cultural diversity and WIPO on the protection of authors, performers, producers and broadcasters rights) could represent a level playing field and provide appropriate framework for domestic policies. The BPF session presents a series of case studies and successful practices that provide useful food for thoughts.

SUMMARY

Roberto Gaetano explained the importance to develop more and more Internet identifiers (for instance domain names and email addresses) in non-ASCII scripts. Without that all non-latin languages and regions of the world are practically excluded from the effective access to Internet.

Lianna Galstyan presented the experience of Armenia educational platform, where -thanks to the state financing- educational resources have been made available on line to all educational institutes of the country.

Ucha Seturi presented the Tusheti project in Georgia where the valorization of a specific territory and of its language has been made possible through an Internet platform that allows direct trade of local products and promotion of tourism in that region.

Ema Edesio and Enyi Omeruoah from Nigeria presented the successful experience of a selfproduced movie : "Kasala" that is now touring around the festivals of the whole world having great success, that has been simultaneously distributed in cinemas and through digital and on-line tools, opening the way to new forms of financing.

Jean Hubert Nankam from Ivory Coast presented his experience of a series of episodes for TV and the web called “Teenagers” distributed on TV and on Facebook, with one main sponsor and a consortium of 8 tv buying the rights for broadcasting distribution. A community of 120.000 adolescents across the region that is now developing into a market for ancillary products, such as music records.

Alain Modot from France but also representing the AUB (African Union of Broadcasters), explained the project of Hub Africa, where -with the seed money from institutional partners (such as EU or development funds publics or privates)- a serie of programmes will be co produced with a consortium of broadcasters, with centralized sales of advertising spaces for the TV and the on line distribution simultaneously.

Gonzalo Laguado from Colombia presented the successful experience of the Colombian film fund Pro-Imagenes, that supports with state funding and with money from taxations of certain activities, the development of movies (including one nominated best foreign movie at the Oscars 2015), TV series and ,more recently, of web series.

Additional question

What ideas surfaced in the discussion with respect to how the IGF ecosystem might make progress on this issue?

Putting in place the proper mechanism created by IGF for the BPF, that consists in identifying experiences models and enablers that could help to solve the lack of local contents in local languages, especially in underdeveloped countries.

Please estimate the total number of participants.

There were around 100 participants in the room.

Please estimate the total number of women and gender-variant individuals present.

Half of the audience in the room was made of women

To what extent did the session discuss gender issues, and if to any extent, what was the discussion?

Gender issue was not the main subject of discussion. But the choice to present the experience of a woman film maker from Nigeria as one of the pivotal example of Best Practice, was a clear message to the participants.

Annexe - Internet Universality Indicators (UNESCO)

Internet Universality Indicators (UNESCO)

second draft, May 2018, <https://en.unesco.org/internetuniversality>

THEME E – LOCAL CONTENT AND LANGUAGE

Relevant content, including content which is generated locally and concerned with local issues, is necessary if people are to use the Internet in order to improve their quality of life or livelihoods, and to contribute to national development. Defining and assessing local content is, however, problematic. People define content which they consider locally relevant in different ways. Language may be one of a number of potential indicators. Social media content posted by individuals may differ in this context from content on websites.

Questions E.1 and E.2 are concerned with the availability of locally-generated content within and about the country, and should also be assessed with reference to the proportion of individuals generating online content (Category R Question B.5).

The availability of content in languages which are used by local populations is also critical to the value of Internet access, particularly for minority language speakers. Questions E.3 and E.4 are concerned with the availability of content in local languages, and should be assessed with reference to contextual indicator 2.D.

E.1 How many Internet domains and servers are there within the country and is this number growing?

Indicator:

Number of registered domains (including both ccTLDs and gTLDs) per thousand population

Number of servers per million population

E.2 Is a substantial and growing volume of content about the country available online, including locally-generated content?

Indicator:

Number of articles/words concerning the country in Wikipedia or an equivalent source,¹⁸ compared with other countries, including source (proportion generated in-country)

E.3 Are domains and online services available which enable individuals to access and use local and indigenous scripts and languages online?

Indicators:

Availability of Internet domains and websites in local scripts

Availability of local languages on major online platforms

Availability of mobile apps in local languages

Availability of content on government websites in all languages with significant user groups within the population

Proportion of content generated in and read by individuals on leading online services, by language, compared with proportion of total population using each language as their principal language